

Full Performance Review

**Division of
Motor Vehicles**

**The Division of Motor Vehicles Has Taken
Appropriate Measures in Tightening Laws
for Obtaining Driver's Licenses and Personal Identification Cards
But It Could Do More**

**The Division of Motor Vehicles Should
Consider Restructuring Its Taxation on
Vehicle Title Transaction**



JOINT COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENT OPERATIONS

Senate

Edwin J. Bowman
Chair

Billy Wayne Bailey, Jr.
Vice Chair

Oshel B. Craigo

Sarah M. Minear

Vic Sprouse

House Of Delegates

Vicki V. Douglas
Chair

Earnest H. Kuhn
Vice Chair

Scott G. Varner

Larry Border

Otis Leggett

Citizen Members

Dwight Calhoun

John Canfield

James Willison

W. Joseph McCoy

(Vacancy)



OFFICE OF THE LEGISLATIVE AUDITOR

Aaron Allred
Legislative Auditor

John Sylvia
Director

David Mullins
Research Manager

Denny Rhodes
Senior Research Analyst

Matthew Parsons
Research Analyst

Performance Evaluation and Research Division

Building 1, Room W-314

State Capitol Complex

Charleston, West Virginia 25305

(304) 347-4890

WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE
Performance Evaluation and Research Division

Building 1, Room W-314
1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East
Charleston, West Virginia 25305-0610
(304) 347-4890
(304) 347-4939 FAX



John Sylvia
Director

January 7, 2003

The Honorable Edwin J. Bowman
State Senate
129 West Circle Drive
Weirton, West Virginia 26062

The Honorable Vicki V. Douglas
House of Delegates
Building 1, Room E-213
1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East
Charleston, West Virginia 25305-0470

Dear Chairs:

Pursuant to the West Virginia Sunset Law, we are transmitting a *Preliminary Performance Review of the Office of Coalfield Community Development*, which will be presented to the Joint Committee on Government Operations on Tuesday, January 7, 2003. The issues covered herein are "The Office of Coalfield Community Development is in Compliance with Most Statutory Mandates;" and "The Office of Coalfield Community Development's Land Valuation Assistance Program is Not Utilized."

We transmitted a draft copy of the report to the Office of Coalfield Development on December 26, 2002. The Agency opted not to have an Exit Conference. We received the agency response on January 2, 2003.

Sincerely,

Handwritten signature of John Sylvia in cursive script.
John Sylvia

JS/wsc

Joint Committee on Government and Finance

Contents

Executive Summary	5
Review Objective, Scope and Methodology	9
Issue 1: The Division of Motor Vehicles Has Taken Appropriate Measures in Tightening Laws for Obtaining Driver's Licenses and Personal Identification Cards But It Could Do More.....	11
Issue 2: The Division of Motor Vehicles Should Consider Restructuring Its Taxation on Vehicle Title Transactions.....	17

List Of Tables

Table 1: Driver's License Legal Presence Legislation Introduced by Other States.....	14
Table 2: Maryland and Virginia Fee Structure.....	19
Table 3: Projected Additional Revenue of Implementing \$500 Minimum Value for FY 2002.....	19
Table 4: Vehicle Valuation Sample.....	20
Table 5: Vehicle Valuation Sample Results.....	21
Table 6: DMV's Recommended Minimum Values.....	22

List Of Appendices

Appendix A: Transmittal Letter to Agency.....	25
Appendix B: 2001-2002 Driver's License/State Identification Bills.....	27
Appendix C: Vehicle Valuation Sample.....	51
Appendix D: ABCA Response.....	57
Appendix E: Agency Response.....	59

Executive Summary

Issue 1: The Division of Motor Vehicles Has Taken Appropriate Measures in Tightening Laws for Obtaining Driver's Licenses and Personal Identification Cards But it Could Do More.

The Division of Motor Vehicles (DMV) has put security measures in place to prevent counterfeit and fraudulent driver's licenses and personal identification cards. The Division has incorporated a state of the art digitized system to decrease the possibility of fraudulent IDs. The Division also has in place an encrypted bar code on the back of the license which allows authorities and businesses with scanners to obtain the information on the front of the license. The Division is establishing an investigative/fraud unit that will investigate the theft of valid driver's licenses, along with other types of fraud. **The Legislative Auditor commends the Division of Motor Vehicles on the security features in place to prevent fraudulent drivers licenses and IDs.**

No matter how state of the art a Driver's License and Identification System, there is no 100% guarantee against forgery. Since the terrorist attacks on September 11, forty-three states have introduced or enacted new legislation to make it more difficult to obtain a driver's license as well as increasing the penalties for having a fraudulent license. **West Virginia is one of the seven states that have not introduced or enacted new legislation.** The Legislative Auditor also found that fifteen states have introduced or passed drivers license legislation that relates to the issue of legal presence, which includes three surrounding states that have already passed legislation. The legislation ties the expiration of the license to the individual's legal presence in the United States, primarily with the visa. While current requirements for obtaining a license are adequate, **measures should be taken to enhance the security regarding the issuance of driver's licenses and personal identification cards.**

Regarding ways to curb underage drinking, the Legislative Auditor believes that the Legislature should consider securing an ultraviolet (UV) feature which can only be viewed by an ultraviolet or black light should be added to the states driver's license. The cost of the UV feature would not only be minimal for the state, but for retailers and bar owners as well, since many bars already have black lights for decoration and lighting purposes. All a retailer or bar owner would have to do is simply place the ID under a black light to determine its validity and to spot holograms that forgers often aren't able to easily create. **Thus, the Legislative Auditor recommends that the DMV consider adding the ultraviolet feature to drivers licenses.**

Issue Area 2: **The Division of Motor Vehicles Should Consider Restructuring Its Taxation on Vehicle Title Transactions.**

West Virginia Code §17A-3-4(b) states that before the Division of Motor Vehicles issues a title for a vehicle, a 5% tax on the vehicle value must be paid. The Division admits that in practice, they will charge a 5% tax on the net purchase price, not the value of the vehicle as provided by the new owner. The Division averages approximately 700,000 title transactions per year. In FY 2002 there were 98,086 transactions valued at \$500 and below, with 28,630 of these vehicles valued at \$100 or less. **In fact, the Legislative Auditor questions how many vehicles valued at less than \$500 could pass West Virginia vehicle inspection.** The DMV commissioner states:

That any vehicle less than \$500 should not be on the road. A good example is that a new set of tires is going to cost more than \$100.

The Division has recommended that they would like to establish the minimum value of a traded vehicle at \$500. The Legislative Auditor agrees with this recommendation of setting the minimum value of a vehicle transaction to \$500 which would be a flat minimum rate charge of \$25 on anything below this standard. The Division would have generated an additional **\$1,333,589** in revenues for FY 2002 if the \$500 minimum value were implemented. Of the five surrounding states, three already have set a minimum value on vehicles for titling fees.

In order to determine whether vehicles have been reported to DMV as undervalued, the Legislative Auditor took a sample of vehicle title transfers valued and taxed for \$500 or less. The sample indicated that 86% (all post-1980 models) of these vehicles carry a Red Book value greater than \$500. Only 2 of the vehicles transacted on August 9, 2002 reported to the DMV as being valued at \$500 or less **actually** had a sales value of \$500 or less, according to the Red Book. **The results of the sample provides supportive evidence of the Legislative Auditor's recommendation.**

Recommendations

1. *The Division of Motor Vehicles should consider all forms of legislation to prevent fraudulent drivers licenses and personal identification cards, such as requiring a picture I.D. for non-residents to obtain a drivers license or tying non-residents drivers license expiration date with their visa.*

-
2. *The Division of Motor Vehicles should consider the addition of an ultraviolet hologram to the West Virginia driver's license to counteract fraudulent use of identifications for underage drinking.*
 3. *The Legislature should consider amending West Virginia Code §17A-3-4(1) by creating a minimum value for vehicle transactions at \$500 and set a flat rate on any transaction \$500 and below at \$25.*
 4. *The Division should audit vehicle transactions to determine the present market value to ensure that the proper tax is being paid by those conducting used vehicle transactions.*
 5. *The Legislative Auditor recommends continuing the audit of the Division of Motor Vehicles in 2003.*

Review Objective, Scope and Methodology

This is a Full Performance Review of the West Virginia Division of Motor Vehicles as required by WVC §4-10-4. The Division of Motor Vehicles (DMV) is responsible for ensuring the ethical interpretation and application of motor vehicle and related laws, providing essential motor vehicle and driver services to the public, promoting highway safety, and collecting revenue for transportation programs.

Objective

The objective of this review is to examine the following issues:

- (1) Has DMV taken appropriate measures to prevent counterfeit and fraudulent driver's licenses and personal identification cards?
- (2) Is the Division's taxation on vehicle title transactions providing an adequate revenue stream?

Scope

The scope of this review is from fiscal year 2001-2002, concerning the activities from the State of West Virginia and other states. The report also includes a sample conducted from information provided by the Division.

Methodology

The Legislative Auditor's Office examined data provided by the Division of Motor Vehicles, which included annual reports, budget documents, and other data provided by the agency. The report was developed through analysis of that data, interviews and information requested from agency personnel, interviews and information from other states, government publications, and information obtained from the internet. Every aspect of this evaluation complied with **Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards (GAGAS)**.

The Division of Motor Vehicles Has Taken Appropriate Measures in Tightening Laws for Obtaining Driver's Licenses and Personal Identification Cards But It Could Do More.

The Division of Motor Vehicles (DMV) has put security measures in place to prevent counterfeit and fraudulent driver's licenses and personal identification cards. The Division has incorporated a state of the art system to decrease the possibility of fraudulent ID's. No matter how state of the art a Driver's License and Identification System, there is no 100% guarantee against forgery. Nonetheless, the Division could do more to decrease the forgery of ID's.

At least four of the nineteen hijackers on September 11 held a Virginia driver's license, which eased their travel around the United States. Since the terrorist attacks, forty- three states have introduced or enacted new legislation to make it more difficult to obtain a driver's license as well as increasing the penalties for having a fraudulent license. **West Virginia is one of the seven states that have not introduced or enacted new legislation.** There is also a growing concern with fake ID's and underage drinking. With advancing computer technology, teens are able to forge a driver's license which allows them to enter illegally into nightclubs as well as purchasing alcohol. In January of 2001, agents of the Alcohol Beverage Control Administration (ABCA) recently cited half of the two dozen Morgantown businesses it investigated for selling alcohol to minors. While the businesses may have been guilty for intentionally selling alcohol to underage customers, the ABCA Commissioner called underage drinking problem a disgrace when visiting the city. The Commissioner stated in a letter to the Legislative Auditor that:

... there is a connection between fake ID's and underage drinking.

In addition, the Commissioner went on to state that:

While detecting fake ID's would not eliminate underage consumption, it would have a dramatic and positive effect.

Current Measures

The Division of Motor Vehicles has already implemented some measures to prevent the use of fraudulent ID's as listed below:

-
1. The Division of Motor Vehicles has incorporated a new state of the art digitized identification system with two biometric identifiers. The first is a facial recognition program which compares various facial features of the individual, including the distance between the pupils of the eyes. If the photos do not match, the system sends back an immediate warning to the Division. West Virginia was one of the first states to incorporate such a feature. The second identifier is a voluntary option to include a fingerprint on their license. To enhance the law, the Division has suggested an option to make the fingerprint option mandatory since the option is available at all drivers licensing services in West Virginia.
 2. The Division also has in place an encrypted bar code on the back of the license which allows authorities and businesses with scanners to obtain the information on the front of the license. The scanner system which was developed by the Alcohol Beverage Control Administration (ABCA) is able to scan ID's from forty-three other states as well as military ID's. However, there are some setbacks with this process:
 - i The scanning systems are expensive at \$1,900 each. ABCA does provide an incentive to businesses that purchase a scanner by offering to reduce any fines for selling alcohol to minors, but the cost is still high, especially for the small business person.
 - i There is no way in determining if the card has been lost or stolen.
 - i The bar code currently does not encode the picture of the licensee, only the text information. (DMV is considering this option)
 3. The Division has made major steps in combating fraudulent ID's usage, and some features recommended by the American Association of Motor Vehicle Administrators (AAMVA) have already been incorporated on the West Virginia Driver's licenses.
 4. The Division is establishing an investigative/fraud unit that will investigate the theft of valid driver's licenses, along with other types of fraud. The unit will be led by two retired State Police officers, and will enhance the Division's ability to track down instances of driver's license fraud.

Proposed Measures by the Legislative Auditor

According to the National Conference of State Legislatures (NCSL), since the terrorist attacks on the United States, twenty one states have enacted new regulations to make it harder to get drivers licenses and personal identification cards. In addition, legislation has been introduced in another twenty two states to tighten regulations on obtaining driverís licenses. West Virginia is one of the few states that have not enacted or proposed new legislation. While current requirements for obtaining a license are adequate, the state should not risk not tightening requirements. Some examples of legislation passed and proposed are listed below, while the full listing from NCSL is available in Appendix A:

- i **California** - Requires the DMV to cross-reference thumb or fingerprints collected at application for driverís license with the state Department of Justice database.
- i **Delaware** - Requires social security number and proof of legal residence in the United States to receive a driverís license.
- i **Kentucky** - Requires proof of legal residence in the United States before the issuance of a license. Also, ties expiration of driverís license of an non-resident with their visa or one year, whichever is shorter.
- i **Virginia** - Increases fines for providing false identification documents and for employees knowingly issuing a driverís license to a person providing false information from a Class 2 misdemeanor to a Class 4 felony.

The Legislative Auditor also found that fifteen states have introduced or passed drivers license legislation that relates to the issue of legal presence. As shown below nine states have introduced legislation establishing legal presence of non-residents , and an additional six, including three surrounding states, have already passed the legislation since September 11. The legislation ties the expiration of the license to the individualís legal presence in the United States, primarily with the visa. Additionally, other states may already have had legislation in place before September 11 establishing legal presence of non-residents, but West Virginia has not.

Table 1
Driver's License Legal Presence Legislation Introduced by Other States

Introduced	Passed
Delaware	Kentucky
Florida	Louisiana
Georgia	New Jersey
Kansas	Ohio
Michigan	South Carolina
Minnesota	Virginia
Mississippi	
New York	
Vermont	

As a security matter, the state should reexamine who should be granted a state's driver's license or identification card and what documents must be presented at application. Currently, West Virginia's Department of Motor Vehicles requires two primary documents needed to apply for a driver's license, which are a birth certificate and social security card. A DMV official stated that:

At the moment the weakest link to verifying identities is the two primary documents to apply for a driver's license. Neither one includes any identifiable features.

While the DMV has current measures in place, the Division could strengthen its security measures, by requesting legislation or issuing requirements such as legal presence legislation that has been added in other states.

Ultraviolet Feature Could Possibly Curb Fake IDs Used to Obtain Alcohol

Regarding ways to curb underage drinking the Legislative Auditor believes that the Division should consider securing an ultraviolet (UV) feature which can only be viewed by an ultraviolet or black light to the state's driver's license. This feature is already used by many credit card companies. In fact, many people may be unaware of this UV feature on their credit cards. Further

research found that Minnesota and Michigan have already added this feature to their drivers licenses. According to an official from Michigan, the cost of the UV feature was 3.7 cents per card.

The cost of the UV feature would not only be minimal for the state, but for retailers and bar owners as well, since many bars already have black lights for decoration and lighting purposes. Black lights can be purchased for less than twenty dollars as opposed to the \$1,900 scanning system. All a retailer or bar owner would have to do is simply place the ID under a black light to determine its validity and to spot holograms that forgers often aren't able to easily create. The ultraviolet feature has worked in the state of Michigan, because according to an official from that state:

[they] have seen very few counterfeits that are even reasonable since they have used the UV security.

The Legislative Auditor finds that the addition of this low cost technology could curb some underage drinking. While the technologically advanced scanner is beneficial, the ultraviolet feature would be an additional layer of security to prevent counterfeit IDs. The scanner system is expensive, and according to a letter from a DMV official, there seem to be very few of them in place. In addition, businesses that can not afford the scanner system would have an additional alternative. In fact, if the DMV added the ultraviolet feature, a West Virginia driver's license would be similar to the security features of a credit card. A credit card has the text information to enter manually on the front along with holograms, and the ultraviolet feature. On the back of the credit card is a magnetic strip that has the information encoded. Thus, the Legislative Auditor recommends that the DMV consider adding the ultraviolet feature to drivers licenses.

Conclusion

The Legislative Auditor commends the Division of Motor Vehicles on the security features in place to prevent fraudulent drivers licenses and IDis. Some of the features recommended for driverís licenses by the AAMVA have already been incorporated by the Division. However, in lieu of the terrorists attacks, measures should be taken to enhance the security regarding the issuance of driverís licenses and personal identification cards. In addition, DMV should look into adding an ultraviolet feature to the IDis to help control underage drinking.

Recommendations

1. *The Division of Motor Vehicles should consider all forms of legislation to prevent fraudulent drivers licenses and personal identification cards, such as requiring a picture I.D. for non-residents to obtain a drivers license or tying non-residents drivers license expiration date with their visa.*
2. *The Division of Motor Vehicles should consider the addition of an ultraviolet hologram to the West Virginia driverís license to counteract fraudulent use of identifications for underage drinking.*

The Division of Motor Vehicles Should Consider Restructuring Its Taxation on Vehicle Title Transactions.

West Virginia Code §17A-3-4(b) states that before the Division of Motor Vehicles issues a title for a vehicle, a 5% tax on the vehicle value must be paid. The Division admits that in practice, they will charge a 5% tax on the net purchase price, not the value of the vehicle as provided by the new owner. A sample of vehicle sales valued by the owner at \$500 or less, indicated that 86% (all post-1980 models) of these vehicles carry a Automobile Red Book value greater than \$500. The Legislative Auditor recommends that the Legislature consider a minimum value for vehicles of \$500 or determine other means to more accurately assess this tax, which would in turn increase revenues for the Division. The Division would have generated an additional **\$1,333,589** in revenues for FY 2002 if the \$500 minimum value were implemented.

Fiscal Year 2002 Vehicle Transactions

The Division averages approximately 700,000 title transactions per year. In FY 2002 there were 98,086 transactions valued at \$500 and below, with 28,630 of these vehicles valued at \$100 or less. While the Legislative Auditor concedes that there are some vehicles valued at less than \$500, these would be minimal at best. **In fact, the Legislative Auditor questions how many vehicles valued at less than \$500 could pass West Virginia vehicle inspection.** The DMV commissioner states:

That any vehicle less than \$500 should not be on the road. A good example is that a new set of tires is going to cost more than \$100.

According to WV Code §17A-3-4(1):

If the vehicle is new, the actual purchase price or consideration to the purchaser of the vehicle is the value of the vehicle. If the vehicle is a used or secondhand vehicle, the present market value at the time of transfer or purchase is the value of the vehicle for the purpose of this section. Provided, That so much of the purchase price or consideration as is represented by the exchange of the other vehicles on which the tax imposed by the section has been paid by the purchaser shall be deducted from the total actual price or consideration, paid for the vehicle, whether the vehicle be new or secondhand.

Individuals Intentionally Lower Market Values to Avoid Higher Taxes

The impression is given that citizens may be lowering the value of a vehicle to avoid paying a higher tax. **Thus, the Legislative Auditor has determined that there is a problem with individuals titling vehicles lower than the present market value to avoid paying higher titling fees.** In addition, part of the problem could be that the Division does not monitor or audit vehicle transactions to determine the market value of the vehicle. For example, when a transaction is submitted to the Division, there is no verification on the part of the Division. Auditing these transactions would require more staffing to carry out that task or task readjustments of the current staff. Nonetheless, the Division is losing potential revenues due to these lowered valuations.

Creating a Minimum Value

The Legislative Auditor conducted a survey of surrounding states, and found that Pennsylvania and Ohio have not set minimum values on vehicles for titling fees. The state of Kentucky has set a minimum value of \$100, however, if a vehicle is sold at a price other than the retail value an affidavit must be signed by both the purchaser and seller. The affidavit then must be notarized and submitted to Kentucky's Department of Motor Vehicles. Maryland and Virginia have implemented a structure with minimum values and fixed rates which is shown in Table 2 below. Maryland charges a 5% fee while Virginia charges 3% fee on the sale price of the vehicle which exceeds their set minimum values.

Table 2
Maryland and Virginia Fee Structure

State	Minimum Value	Fixed Rate
Maryland	\$640	\$32
Virginia	\$1,166	\$38

Source: Maryland and Virginia Motor Vehicles

In conversations with officials from West Virginia's Division of Motor Vehicles, the Commissioner recommended that they would like to establish the minimum value of a traded vehicle at \$500. The Legislative Auditor agrees with this recommendation of setting the minimum value of a vehicle transaction to \$500 which would be a flat minimum rate charge of \$25 on anything below this standard. Transaction figures provided by the Division allowed the Legislative Auditor to calculate the projected revenues received in FY 2002 if a minimum value of \$500 was in place. The Division would have generated an additional **\$1,333,589** in revenues for FY 2002 if the \$500 minimum value were implemented. Table 3 below represents how much revenue was received in FY 2002 and how much would have been received if the minimum value recommendation was in place:

Table 3
Projected Additional Revenue of Implementing
\$500 Minimum Value for FY 2002

Dollar Range	Total Transactions	Total Revenue Received	Projected Revenue Received	Revenue Difference
1-100	28,630	\$71,575	\$715,750	\$644,175
101-200	19,814	\$148,605	\$495,350	\$346,745
201-300	16,937	\$211,713	\$423,425	\$211,712
301-400	9,839	\$172,183	\$245,975	\$73,792
401-500	22,866	\$514,485	\$571,650	\$57,165
Totals	98,086	\$1,118,561	\$2,452,150	\$1,333,589

Source: DMV and PERD analysis

Vehicle Sample Further Substantiates the Need for a Minimum Tax Value

In order to determine whether vehicles have been reported to DMV as undervalued, the Legislative Auditor took a sample of vehicle title transfers valued and taxed for \$500 or less. The Legislative Auditor requested from the Division the number of vehicles sold for \$500 or less for the week of August 5 - 9, 2002. The Division then provided to the Legislative Auditor a listing of each vehicle sold for the day. For this particular week, Friday, August 9th had the lowest amount of transactions for \$500 or below, which was 281 transactions. The Legislative Auditor decided to use August 9th as the sample date. The following table shows the breakdown of the sample along with the reported sales value.

Table 4
Vehicle Valuation Sample

Sales Value	Number of Vehicles Transacted	Percentage
\$100 or less	74	26%
\$101 - \$200	53	19%
\$201 - \$300	45	16%
\$301 - \$400	34	12%
\$401 - \$500	75	27%
Totals	281	100%

Source: Division of Motor Vehicles

The list of 281 transactions included: the Vehicle Identification Number; the make of the vehicle; the model year of the vehicle; the amount of the actual sale; and the tax paid. The Legislative Auditor then used data from the Red Book. The Red Book value of each the 281 vehicle transactions was then determined by inputting the Vehicle Identification Number from each transaction which then returned the make, model, year, and Red Book sale value of the car. In cases where more than one sale value was provided, the Legislative Auditor chose the lowest of the values. To clarify, the Red Book sale values returned were for vehicles which were in what is considered as "good" condition. The Legislative Auditor has no knowledge of the condition of the vehicles included in this sample, nor the amount of mileage on the vehicles. In addition, the Red Book values were only for vehicles from model year 1981 and above. Vehicles

before 1981 are not included in the Red Book and are all just assigned a general value of \$100, although 2 pre-1981 vehicles did return a value. In this sample of the 281 transactions, 36 were pre-1981 vehicles, which returned no value.

The results of the sample provides supportive evidence of the Legislative Auditor's recommendation. Only 2 of the vehicles transacted on August 9, 2002 reported to the DMV as being valued at \$500 or less **actually** had a sales value of \$500 or less, according to the Red Book. These two vehicles had a Red Book value of \$500. There were no post-1980 vehicles valued at less than \$500. While more than half of the sample (140 transactions) was valued at \$1,000 or less, **105 transactions had Red Book values over \$1000.** In addition, 55 vehicles, or 20% of the total sample, were valued at \$2,000 or more. The highest valued vehicle was for a Chevrolet truck, with an Red Book value of \$20,385, and reported to the DMV by the new purchaser of having a value of \$500. The following table displays the sample results. Again, while the Legislative Auditor does not know the condition of the vehicles sold, the sample does show that there is some under reporting of a vehicle's value to the DMV in order to lower the tax. The full sample is located in Appendix B.

**Table 5
Vehicle Valuation Sample Results**

Red Book Sales Value	Number Within This Range	Percentage
Pre 1981*	36	13%
\$500 or less	2	less than 1%
\$501 - \$1,000	138	49%
\$1,001 - \$2,000	50	18%
\$2,001 - \$5,000	44	16%
\$5,001 or above	11	4%
<i>* Red Book assigns pre-1981 vehicles with a general \$100 value</i>		
<i>Source: Automobile Red Book</i>		

As stated previously, the Division is losing potential revenues due to these lowered valuations. On this particular date, the Division received revenues of \$4,033 from vehicles transacted at \$500 or less. If the minimum \$500 tax value would have been in place, the Division would have received \$7,025, a difference of \$2,992. In addition, with the additional revenue generated from setting a minimum value, the Division could add staff to audit the transactions that could be possibly undervalued. The Legislative Auditor analyzed the potential lost revenues in this sample just from the 109 transactions with Red Book values of \$1,000 or more. **If these transactions were taxed at the Red Book values, then the Division would have received \$15,493 in taxes or \$13,753 of additional tax revenues. The added revenues from these tax receipts in one day could have paid a large portion of a DMV auditor's salary.** While the Legislative Auditor's sample is only a small representation of one day's sales, the results do show justification for a minimum value.

Division of Motor Vehicles Recommended Values

In addition, representatives from the Division offered recommendations for minimum values on all vehicles transacted by model year. Table 6 displays the Division's recommended values.

Table 6
DMV's Recommended Minimum Values

Model Year	Minimum Value
1980 or less	\$500
1981 - 1985	\$1,000
1986 - 1990	\$1,500
1991 - 1995	\$2,000
1996 - 1999	\$3,000

Source: WV Division of Motor Vehicles

If the Division would have had the desired minimum values from Table 6 in place for FY 2002, an additional **\$8,840,685** of revenues would have been received. While additional revenues would be raised, the Division states that several staff would have to be added to offset the increased workload (i.e. handling complaints and explaining the new values). The Legislative Auditor agrees that the minimum value on all vehicles transacted should not be less than

\$500, but cannot make a determination on whether minimum values should be set as high as the DMV recommends. While the minimum values do seem fair, citizens could claim that many vehicles fall well below these values. **The Legislative Auditor recommends that at a minimum, the rate should be assessed a minimum value of \$500.** In addition, the Legislative Auditor finds that with the additional revenues created by setting the minimum value to \$500, the DMV could possibly hire additional staff to audit vehicle transactions for accuracy and legitimacy to determine the present market value of transactions. With staff to audit vehicle transactions, the Division could in turn create **additional** revenues by verifying present market values, which could substantiate the Division's recommended values as shown in Table 6.

Conclusion

According to West Virginia Code, the Division of Motor Vehicles shall charge a 5% fee on the value of a vehicle before the issuance of the vehicle's title. However, in practice the Division charges a 5% fee of the purchase price of the vehicle. This is a problem for the Division since in some instances individuals intentionally lower the price of the vehicle to avoid paying a higher transaction fee. The Legislative Auditor agrees that individuals are lowering the sale price of the vehicle in order to pay a lower transaction fee. A sample of vehicle sales valued by the owner at \$500 or less, indicated that 86% of these vehicles carry a Red Book value greater than \$500. The Legislative Auditor recommends setting a minimum value of a vehicle transaction at \$500 with a flat rate charge of \$25 on transactions \$500 or less. DMV would have generated an additional **\$1,333,589** in revenues for FY 2002 if the Legislative Auditor's recommendation was in place. In order to determine if the Division of Motor Vehicles recommended vehicle values in Table 6 are justifiable, the Legislative Auditor would like to continue the audit of the Department of Motor Vehicles in 2003.

Recommendations

3. *The Legislature should consider amending West Virginia Code §17A-3-4(1) by creating a minimum value for vehicle transactions at \$500 and set a flat rate on any transaction \$500 and below at \$25.*
4. *The Division should audit vehicle transactions to determine the present market value to ensure that the proper tax is being paid by those conducting used vehicle transactions.*

-
5. *The Legislative Auditor recommends continuing the audit of the Division of Motor Vehicles in 2003 to review all vehicle values with respect to the sales tax accessed to determine the likelihood of further abuse.*

Appendix A: Transmittal Letter

WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE *Performance Evaluation and Research Division*

Building 1, Room W-314
1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East
Charleston, West Virginia 25305-0610
(304) 347-4890
(304) 347-4939 FAX



John Sylvia
Director

December 26, 2002

Roger Pritt, Commissioner
Division of Motor Vehicles
Building 3, Room 113
1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East
Charleston, WV 25305

Dear Mr. Pritt:

This is to transmit a draft copy of the Full Performance Evaluation of The Division of Motor Vehicles. This report is scheduled to be presented at the Sunday, January 5, 2003 interim meeting of the Joint Committee on Government Operations. It is expected that a representative from your agency be present at the meeting to orally respond to the report and answer any questions the committee may have.

We need to schedule an exit conference to discuss any concerns you may have with the report. We would like to schedule the meeting with you sometime before January 2, 2003. Please notify us to schedule an exact time. In addition, we need your written response by noon on January 2 in order for it to be included in the final report. If your agency intends on distributing additional material to committee members at the meeting; please contact the House Government Organization staff at 340-3192 by Thursday, January 2 to make arrangements.

We request that your personnel treat the draft report as confidential and that it not be disclosed to anyone not affiliated with your agency. Thank you for your cooperation.

Sincerely,

Handwritten signature of John Sylvia in cursive script.
John Sylvia

Enclosure

Joint Committee on Government and Finance

Florida	Hawaii	Illinois	Kansas
Kentucky	Louisiana	Maine	Maryland
Massachusetts	Michigan	Minnesota	Mississippi
Missouri	Nebraska	New Hampshire	New Jersey
New Mexico	New York	North Carolina	Ohio
Oklahoma	Pennsylvania	Rhode Island	South Carolina
South Dakota	Tennessee	Texas	Utah
Virginia	Vermont	Washington	Wisconsin

State	Bill Number	Summary	Last Action as of May 2002
Alaska	HB 344	Increase fees for non commercial driver's licenses and identification cards to allow state to convert to digital technology for identification cards and driver's licenses	January 18, 2002: Introduced. April 15, 2002: Passed House. May 1, 2002: Do Pass from Senate Finance Committee.
Alabama	HB 419	Authorizes the Department of Public Safety to implement security upgrades for driver licensing including features to aid law enforcement in determining whether the vehicle belongs to the license holder and bar codes with criminal history.	Died at end of regular session.
Arkansas	HB 1028	Allows passport photographs to be used on driver's license and allow for thumbprint on driver's license to be optional.	March 23, 2001: Withdrawn by Author.
Arizona	HB 2255	Removes provisions requiring proof of legal presence in United States under federal law and allowing other documents in lieu of social security number. Also, adding provision that possession of a driver's license is not proof of U.S. citizenship.	January 21, 2002: read second time in House.
	SB 1459	See HB 2255	March 14, 2002: Held in Committee

California	AB 2112	Non-residents 21 years of age or older, transporting hazardous materials must have hazardous materials endorsement that is recognized by the state.	February 19, 2002: Introduced. May 9, 2002: Passed Assembly, in Senate to Rules Committee
	AB 60	Allows use of individual taxpayer identification number in lieu of social security number when social security number is not available. Requires showing of lawful presence in the United States, or that application for lawful immigration status has been initiated. Limits the duration of licenses or identification cards issued under these circumstances to 3 years.	Passed both Houses, then withdrawn from enrollment by author: January 14, 2002.
	AB 1155	Makes it a crime for a government employee knowingly assist another person in obtaining a driver's license, identification card, or other document issued by Department of Motor if the employee knows that the person is not entitled to that document and that the person intends to use the document for an unlawful purpose.	Passed Assembly June 5, 2001. June 12, 2001: in Senate Committees on Public Safety and Rules.
	AB 1474	Requires the DMV to cross-reference thumb or fingerprints collected at application for driver's license or identification cards with state Department of Justice database to prevent fraud. Increases driver's license fees to pay for system. Bill also prohibits use of this information by third parties.	Passed Assembly June 4, 2001. June 12, 2002 referred to Senate Transportation Committee.
	AB 1754	Creates conspiracy misdemeanor for individuals other than government employees who assists another in obtaining a DMV document (e.g. driver's license or identity card) punishable by up to 6 months in jail and/or \$50,000 fine.	May 23, 2002: Assembly Committee on Public Safety voted to pass.

	AB 2113	Creates misdemeanor for government employee to assist an individual in fraudulently obtaining a DMV document. Mandates that renewal of driver's licenses and identity cards must be made in person and requires DMV to compare photographs and likeness of information provided for issuance of new, or duplicate license or I.D.	May 14, 2002: Assembly Committee on Public Safety voted do pass. May 16, 2002: Referred to Appropriations Committee.
	SB 661	DMV to create biometric identifier from the collect thumbprint at application for driver's license or identification card.	Died February 4, 2002.
	SB 1254	Expands "personal identifying information" in identity theft law to include federal driver's license, biometric information, and other specified information. Also, this legislation increases penalties related to possession of identity information.	Passed Assembly May 8, 2002. May 20, 2002: in Senate Committee on Public Safety.
Colorado	SB 112	Requires that to receive a driver's license while using an out of state license for proof of age from a state that does not require license to be present in the U.S. lawfully, additional documentation is needed to prove lawful presence.	April 2, 2002: Signed by Governor.
	SB 67	Authorizes the division of motor vehicles to issue a driver's license, temporary license, or identification card to a person with an individual taxpayer identification number issued by the internal revenue service. Eliminates the prohibition against issuing a driver's license, temporary license, or identification card to a person who is not legally in the country.	Introduced: January 11, 2002. Died in Senate Committee on Government, Veterans and Military Relations, and Transportation: February 14, 2002.
	HB 1187	Decreases the term validity of a driver's license or identity card from 10 to 5 years.	April 3, 2002: postponed indefinitely (dcad) in House appropriations committee.

Delaware	SB 287	Requires social scrutiny number and proof of legal residence in the United States to receive a driver's license or identification card, and revocation if individual is deported.	In Senate Public Safety Committed, January 22, 2002
	SB 299	Ties expiration of driver's license and identity cards to the date of expiration of legal presence in the United States. Requires proof of continued legal presence upon renewal.	Introduced March 12, 2002. In Senate Public Safety Committed.
	SB 310	Fixes expiration of driver's license to date the of termination of legal residence in the United States.	Introduced March 14, 2002. In Senate Public Safety Committed.
Florida	HB 223	Provides, that foreign residents who are in Florida with a visa and who are issued a Florida driver's license, that the driver's license shall expire 4 years after the date of issuance or upon the expiration of the visa, whichever date first occurs; prohibits renewal of a driver's license to a person who has been issued a visa unless the person presents a valid visa at the time of renewal.	Tabled: March 14, 2002.
	HB 899	Similar to SB 306 (Enacted)	Died: March 22, 2002
	SB 306	Adds provisions to fraudulent driver's license or identification card manufacture or sale. Allows investigation of activities by law enforcement.	Approved by Governor April 25, 2002 (Chap. 2002-178).
	SB 520	Revises application requirements for driver's licenses and identification cards including use of out of state licenses from states that require submission of documentation of legal presence in the United States. Applicants may include submission of fingerprints. If nonimmigrant status is documented, expiration of the license is the date of expiration of	Passed Senate February 20, 2002. Passed House as amended: March 20, 2002. Senate concurred: March 22, 2002. Presented to Governor: April 30, 2002. Signed May 15, 2002.

		<p>those documents with a maximum of two years duration. If green card is used for identification the license shall expire on the fourth birthday after issue and individual is exempted from renewal in person. If identity is established by employment authorization card or any document for showing nonimmigrant classification, expiration is 4 years (or on the expiration of the document if sooner) after issue and requires renewal in person (changes of name or address must also be made in person). Also, amends statutes related to fraudulent manufacture and sale of driver's licenses and identification cards.</p>	
	SB 324	<p>Foreign residents who are in Florida with a visa and who are issued a Florida driver's license, that the driver's license shall expire 4 years after the date of issuance or upon the expiration of the visa, whichever date first occurs; prohibits renewal of a driver's license to a person who has been issued a visa unless the person presents a valid visa at the time of renewal.</p>	<p>Died in Senate Transportation Committee: March 22, 2002.</p>
Georgia	HB 1008	<p>Licenses expire upon ending of legal authorization in the United States. New licenses issued shall indicate whether the licensee is a U.S. citizen and the date of the end of their legal authorization in the United States.</p>	<p>Read for second time in House: January 16, 2002.</p>
	SB 480	<p>Similar to HB 1008</p>	<p>Read and referred in Senate February 25, 2002.</p>

	HB 851	Changes the definition of 'Resident' to a person who, except for infrequent, brief absences, has been present in the state for 30 or more days; provided, however, that any person's status as a resident shall be determined without regard to whether such person is either a United States citizen or an alien with or without legal authorization from the U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service.	March 7, 2001: read second time.
	HB 983	Allows use of driver's license issued by a state that borders Georgia or a license issued by a country that borders the United States for driving in the state.	Introduced January 14, 2002.
	HB 1131	Creates crime for manufacture, sale, or distribution of any counterfeit or altered driver's license or identification card and establishes penalties.	January 30, 2002: To House Committee on Special Judiciary.
Hawaii	HB 926	Allows use of unexpired passport in lieu of birth certificate to prove U.S. citizenship for issuance of identification certificate from the state.	Carried over from 2001. Died at end of 2002 session May 2, 2002.
	HB 986	Creates the felony for sale or manufacture of deceptive identification document.	Approved by Governor June 13, 2001 (Act 230)
	SB 645	Relating primarily to underage drinking--this bill requires magnetic strips or bar codes to be placed on all drivers' licenses and identification cards to allow for electronic verification of age at the time of alcohol sales.	Passed Senate March 6, 2001. Carried over from 2001. Died at end of 2002 session May 2, 2002.
	SB 786	Creates felony offense for the manufacture or sale of false identification to an individual under the age of twenty-one.	Carried over from 2001. Died at end of 2002 session May 2, 2002.

Illinois	HB 3382	Amends the Illinois Vehicle Code; allows the Secretary of State to accept an alternate form of identification for an applicant for a driver's license who does not have a Social Security Number; provides that a temporary license may be issued to an applicant if he or she is applying for a non-photo driver's license for religious reasons or as a result of facial disfigurement and is waiting for that application to be processed.	In Rules Committee: May 23, 2001.
	HB 4174	As amended, requires Department of State Police and Secretary of State to develop a policy for collecting and encoding fingerprint information on driver's licenses and identification cards. Requires report to be submitted by April 1, 2003 on proposed policy, fiscal impact and suggested legislative measures.	April 5, 2002: in House Rules Committee.
	HB 4472	Revises vehicle code to add prohibition of knowing use of use of fraudulent or altered driver's license or identification to purchase a ticket on, or board, a "common carrier."	Passed Both Houses: May 7, 2002.
	HB 4951	Increases penalties for manufacturing or using false information to obtain a fictitious driver's license or identification card. Also, increases penalties for possession, manufacturing, etc. of a false driver's license or identification card.	April 5, 2002: in House Rules Committee.
	SB 167	Provides that the Secretary of State shall license applicants request substitute for the applicants Social Security number his or her federal tax number or an alternative identifying number to be assigned by the Secretary.	May 22, 2001: in Senate Rules Committee, Co-sponsor added.

	SB 1926	Driver's licenses and identification cards issued to persons under the age of 21 shall include the date upon the person turns 21 years of age.	Sent to Governor May 22, 2002.
	HR 4	Urges the state Attorney General to review the policies or requiring SSN at application for state driver's license.	Resolution Adopted, March 21, 2001.
Kansas	HB 2135	Amends language relating driver's licensing, allowing use of IRS taxpayer identification number.	Introduced: January 24, 2002. Referred to House Judiciary Committee: February 28, 2002.
	SB 410	Adds digital images to "motor vehicle records" that are not to be disclosed. Amends purposes and procedures for how and when those records can be disclosed including their use for carrying out law enforcement.	Approved by Governor April 24, 2002.
	SB 559	Requires facial recognition identifier. Requires social security number. Requires legal presence in the United States. Temporary driving permit can be issued to individual not lawfully present in the United States that possess an IRS taxpayer identification number and can show KS residency. The temporary permit is revoked on expiration of visa and must be renewed annually.	Passes Senate: March 12, 2002. Failed in House: April 11, 2002.
Kentucky	HB 106	Implements a statewide child identification program where children between ages of 2 and 15 can be issued a non-driver identification card where picture taken for the card is stored in the driver license information system.	April 9, 2002: Signed by Governor (Acts ch. 261)

	HB 188	Requires the circuit clerk to verify a person's driving status in the National Drivers Register before issuing the person a Kentucky license; requires applicants for a license to provide proof of residency; prohibits the issuance of a nondriver's identification card to any person who has a driver's license or instruction permit. License expiration when visa expires or one year, whichever is shorter. License renewal always one year.	April 9, 2002: Signed by Governor (Acts ch. 264)
	HB 189	Requires all new applicants and persons initially renewing a commercial driver's license to undergo a state and national criminal background check. Allows a non-resident to be issued a CDL instruction permit and CDL if the person is enrolled in a truck driving program. Requires that non-residents be issued a provisional Class D license for the purpose of including a CDL instruction permit into a single license.	April 5, 2002: Signed by Governor (Acts ch. 204)
	HB 867	Creates a 16 member task force to analyze the cost to implement a process to issue secure and tamper-proof digitized driver licenses	Passed House: March 19, 2002. In Senate Transportation Committee: March 25, 2002.
	HB 205	Requires the Social Security number of an applicant for an operator's license only if the applicant has a Social Security number; expands the list of eligible documents used by foreign nationals applying for a Kentucky operator's license.	January 9, 2002: to House Transportation Committee.

Louisiana	SB 89 A	Ties expiration of visa to the expiration of driver's license, and prohibits nonresident alien from providing false information regarding lawful presence at application.	Signed by Governor: April 18, 2002.
	HB 107A	Removes identification cards issued by federal, state, or local government agencies and out-of-state drivers' licenses from the list of identification documents and adds permanent resident alien cards issued after July 1997. Allows department to issue licenses and identification cards for a duration of less than years based on evaluation of immigration information.	Introduced March 25, 2002. April 1, 2002: In House Transportation Committee.
Maine	HB 80 (LD 89)	Eliminates the requirement that a person submit a SSN for application for driver's license.	Introduced January 9, 2001. Died on May 16, 2001.
	HB 850 (LD1122)	Exempts clergy from submitting SSN for driver's license	Died on April 30, 2001.
	SB 192	Repealing requirement that an individual who applies to the Motor Vehicle Administration for an application for an identification card may not have a driver's license; and repealing a requirement that a holder of an identification card surrender the identification card upon being issued a driver's license by the Administration.	
Maryland	HB 1036	Authorizes the Motor Vehicle Administration's investigative division can issue citations for violations related to the issuance of identification laws.	Signed by Governor: April 25, 2002 (Chapter 100)
	SB 639	HB 1036	Vetoed by Governor May 15, 2002. Cross filed bill (HB 1036) was signed.

	SB 192	Repeals a requirement that an individual who applies for an identification card may not have a driver's license. Also repeals a requirement that a holder of an identification card surrender the identification card upon being issued a driver's license.	February 18, 2002: Senate Judiciary Proceedings Committee reported unfavorably.
Massachusetts	HB 1268	Amends current law so as not to allow holders of valid out of state licenses to apply for a state liquor purchase identification card.	House Committee reported May 23, 2001.
	HB 3087	Allows employees of liquor establishments to confiscate identification cards and licenses believed to be fraudulent.	Bill now accompanies a study order (HB 5031) Discharged to House Committee on Rules: April 23, 2002.
	HB 3391	Eliminates the requirement that applicants for certain licenses provide their social security numbers. (not sure if this includes DL)	
Michigan	HB 4037	Increases penalty for fraudulent duplication of driver's license. Establishes penalty for possession of fraudulent license.	Approved by Governor: April 9, 2002 (Public Act 126-02)
	HB 5041	Bill was tie-barred to HB 4037	
	HB 5497	Prohibits the secretary of state from issuing a driver license to a person who is in the United States unlawfully. Further, the bill specifies that the expiration of a legal alien's license would be the customary expiration date (on the birthday of the person in the fourth year following the date of issuance), or the date on which that person's presence in the United States became unlawful, whichever occurred first.	Passed House: February 7, 2002. In Senate Committee on Transportation and Tourism: February 13, 2002.

	HB 5504	Requires applicant for HAZMAT to provide fingerprints. No license will be granted if violation under "terrorism" section of MI criminal law. Revocation for violation of "terrorism" or if individual if DMV has been notified that the individual is a security risk under the U.S. Patriot act by the U.S. DOT.	Passed House: February 28, 2002. Amended in Senate and Passed March 21, 2002. Houses Concurred April 18, 2002. Approved by Governor: May 2, 2002 (Public Act 259-02)
	SB 931	Prohibits issuance of identification card to individuals not lawfully present in the United States. Issued identification cards will expire on the date presence is no longer lawful.	Passed Senate: February 6, 2002. In House Committee on Transportation: February 6, 2002.
	SB 935	Requires submission of fingerprints for group designation for license. Criminal background checks.	December 11, 2001: In Senate Committee on Transportation and Tourism.
	SB 943	Establishes penalty for transporting items requiring labeling under federal regulations for hazardous materials. Prohibits transport of hazardous materials without proper endorsement.	Approved by Governor April 9, 2002 (Public Act 118-02)
	SB 955	Increases penalty for fraudulent reproduction or alteration of a driver's license.	December 13, 2001: In Senate Committee on Transportation and Tourism
	SB 960	Requires lawful presence in the United States to obtain a driver's license. Department may report information on the illegal status of an individual found in examination of documents submitted for driver's license.	December 13, 2001: In Senate Committee on Transportation and Tourism

Minnesota	HF 2622	Requires proof of residency in state for driver's license application and renewal. Requires proof of lawful presence in the United States. Driver's license from another U.S. state is proof of lawful presence. If presence is only lawful for 30 days or less no license can be issued. Licenses issued expire on the date legal presence ends or the earlier of 4 years. Incorporates federal regulations for HAZMAT endorsement.	Action
	HB 2487	Requires proof of residency in state for driver's license application and renewal. Requires proof of lawful presence in the United States. Driver's license from another U.S. state is proof of lawful presence. If presence is only lawful for 30 days or less no license can be issued. Licenses issued expire on the date legal presence ends or the earlier of 4 years.	Action
	HB 2946 SB 2683 SB 2855	Among other provisions, if applicant is not a citizen or permanent alien, license expires on date visa expires.	Action
	HF 3686	Resolution urging the U.S. Congress to repeal federal law requiring states to record social security number on application for a driver's license.	March 12, 2002: Introduced.
	SF 3327	Companion to HF 3686	February 20, 2002: Referred to Senate Transportation Committee.
	HF 2122	Prohibits making or possessing a counterfeit driver's licenses or identification cards or having materials for counterfeiting.	April 17, 2001: Committee reported to pass as amended.
	SF 1711	Companion to HF 2122	May 7, 2001: Referred to Senate Judiciary Committee.

Mississippi	HB 1348	Driver's licenses and identification cards issued to non-U.S. citizens shall expire in one year.	Died in Committee: February 5, 2002.
	SB 2737	Driver's licenses and identification cards issued to non-U.S. citizens shall expire in one year.	Passed Senate: February 13, 2002. Died in House: March 5, 2002.
Missouri	HB 1416	Requires person with immigration visa to notify the Director of Revenue of that fact upon application for driver's license.	March 19, 2002: Executive session held, voted do pass.
	HB 1462	Details not available	Introduced January 15, 2002; Withdrawn by author January 16, 2002.
	HB 1881	Allows the Director of the Department of Revenue to require aliens, at the time of application for a driver's license, to provide a translated and notarized copy of a birth certificate in addition to all other required information. Also allows individual taxpayer identification number (ITIN) instead of social security number.	Passed House: April 4, 2002. April 15, 2002; Senate Committee voted Do Pass.
	LB 574	Provides for the implementation of a digital system (for signatures and photos) for issuance of motor vehicle operators' licenses and identification cards.	Signed by Governor March 28, 2001.
New Hampshire	HB 1456	Creates a misdemeanor for any person to knowingly scan, record, retain, or store, in any electronic format, personal information obtained from any driver's license, unless authorized by the department of safety.	Signed by Governor: May 17, 2002.

New Jersey	AB 3922	Under current law, licenses are not granted to individual's not lawfully present in the United States. This bill addresses the problem of illegal aliens presenting false documents in order to receive a license. These bills also would close a loophole which has allowed certain aliens whose green cards have expired to retain a legal driver's license. The bill would require any license or identification card issued to an alien to expire on the date the alien's authorization to be in the United States expires.	November 19, 2001: Introduced and referred to assembly appropriations committee.
	SB 2630	Identical to AB 3922	November 29, 2001: Combined With S2708
	SB 1159	Makes the forgery of means of identification, including a driver's license, a crime of the third degree.	February 25, 2002: Introduced and referred to Senate Judiciary Committee
	SB 1332	Identical to AB 1346. Amends offenses related to unlawful use of "personal identifying information."	Introduced and referred to Senate Judiciary Committee: March 14, 2002
	AB 1346	Identical to SB 1332.	Second reading February 4, 2002.
	SB 2708	Driver's license and identification card expiration shall be fixed to end of legal presence in the United States. Director may refuse to grant a license if there is reason to suspect any identification documents are false until they are verified. Requires the use of digital pictures on driver's license. Allows the use of non-laminated licenses if they are secure. Allows the storage of motor vehicle information, digital photo and digital signature on a magnetic strip on the license.	January 8, 2002: Approved (P.L.2001, c.391).
New Mexico	HB 135	Allows Secretary to establish, by regulation, other documents that may be accepted instead of social security number.	Signed by Governor February 28, 2002.

New York	AB 9835	New York State driver's license of a resident from a foreign country, who has been issued a visa in this state, shall expire upon the expiration of the visa.	May 14, 2002: held for consideration in Assembly Transportation Committee.
	AB 9603	Allows the use of the individual tax identification number when a legal immigrant applies for a driver's license.	January 11, 2002: in Assembly Transportation Committee.
	SB 6062	Concurrent expiration of driver's license and visa.	May 5, 2002: amended in Senate Transportation Committee.
	AB 9586	Drivers licenses of aliens lawfully admitted for permanent residence in the United States and in New York to provide for concurrent expirations of such alien's visa and driver's license.	Amended in Transportation Committee: May 10, 2002
	AB 9738	Allows the use of alternate forms of identification where an applicant for a driver's license does not have a social security number or an individual tax identification number.	January 22, 2002: referred to Assembly Transportation Committee
	SB 2721	Every applicant for a driver's license on non-driver identification card will be required to submit proof that the applicant's presence in the United States is lawful under federal law.	Ordered to third reading with amendments March 12, 2002.
North Carolina	SB 600	Orders Division to recall all driver's licenses issued with invalid or fictitious social security number and reissue licenses upon showing a valid social security number.	Passed Senate April 25, 2001, in House Committee as of October 10, 2001.
Ohio	SB 184	Makes all licenses issued to temporary residents nonrenewable and may not be relied upon to obtain a license in another state. Nonrenewable license expires on same date on legal presence document.	Signed by Governor: May 15, 2002.

Oklahoma	HB 2887	Requires applicants for driver's license or identification card to submit fingerprint to be placed on driver's license.	Failed: March 6, 2002.
	SB 982	Requires applicants for driver's license or identification card to submit fingerprint to be placed on driver's license.	Passed Senate: February 28, 2002. Failed in House: April 16, 2002.
	HB 1308	Authorizes the use of fingerprints to prove identity for license or identification card. Adds fingerprint image to personal identifying information exception for state open records act. Also adds provision providing for \$1 of license renewal fees, \$3 of identification card renewal fees and \$5 of license replacement fees are deposited into Department of Public Safety Computer Imaging System Revolving Fund to be used solely for the purpose of administration and maintenance of the computerized imaging system of the Department. Provides for licenses that bear the social security number shall be replaced with a computer generated number.	Signed by Governor: June 4, 2001.
	HB 2277	Increases fine for providing false identification documents. Increases fine for employee knowingly issuing a state driver's license to a person providing false information.	February 5, 2002: to House Criminal Justice Committee.
Pennsylvania	HB 2416	Establishes thumbprint or other biometric database to be used for authentication of an individual's identification for driver's licensing purposes only.	Referred to Transportation Committee March 13, 2002.
Rhode Island	HB 6923	Requires all drivers license applicants to furnish proof that they are lawful residents of the United States. This act would take effect upon passage.	January 30, 2002: Scheduled for hearing and/or consideration in House Corporations Committee.

	HB 7208	Resolution creating a commission to study the feasibility of encrypting state identification cards and driver's licenses with bar codes.	February 5, 2002: to House Finance Committee.
South Carolina	HB 4382	A driver's license issued to a person who is in the state pursuant to a student or work visa or to a dependent of that person expires the earlier date of either five years from its issuance, upon the expiration of the person's visa, or when the person's visa is revoked.	In House Committee on Education and Public Works: January 15, 2002.
	HB 4601	Allows refugees and their dependents to obtain driver's licenses.	In House Committee on Education and Public Works: January 29, 2002.
	HB 4670	Prohibits certain persons from other countries who are present in South Carolina on a student visa or on a work visa or their dependents to obtain a driver's license or have their driver's license renewed.	Passed Both Houses: May 16, 2002.
	HB 3306	Prohibits the department of motor vehicles from issuing a motor vehicle driver's license to or renew the driver's license of a person who is an illegal alien.	Passed House: April 5, 2001. Senate Transportation Committee April 10, 2001.
	SB 814	Requires steps be taken to ensure applicant for HAZMAT is not on the terrorist watch list.	January 8, 2002: In Senate Judiciary Committee
	SB 1051	Similar to HB 4670.	
South Dakota	HB 1259	Adds race to information that must be provided at application for, and displayed on, a driver's license	Died at end of regular session.
Tennessee	HB 2695	Creates list of primary and secondary documents allowed for proof of identity and state residency.	Carried over to 2003 session.
	SB 2680	Identical to HB 2695.	In Senate Transportation Committee: April 23, 2002.

	HB 3486	Requires the Department to examine the state's licensing requirements in view of homeland security issues and report findings and recommendations.	On calendar in House for May 22, 2002.
	SB 3139	Identical to HB 3186	Passed Senate April 24, 2002, In House.
	HB 2028	Requires affidavit stating that no social security number was issued and the submission of IRS I 94 form in order for a person without a social security number to be issued a license; redefines "resident" for purposes of drivers license issuance.	January 15, 2002: Assigned to subcommittee on Transportation Safety and Planning.
	HB 2029	Removes provision allowing person without social security number to obtain license.	April 23, 2002: Action defeated in subcommittee on Public Transportation and Highways.
	SB 1999	Identical to HB 2029	Assigned to subcommittee of Transportation: April 23, 2002
	SB 1266	Authorizes person without social security number to receive driver license if person submits an affidavit affirming that they have never been issued social security number. Also allows noncitizens to be given a driver's license if they provide proper documents demonstrating identification.	Signed by Governor: May 3, 2001.
	HB 983	Identical to SB 1266	See SB 1266
Texas	HB 396	Allows use of other documents if applicant for driver's license does not have a social security number including a tax identification number or a letter from the social security administration. Bill also includes list of documents to prove identity at application for driver's license including a passport, foreign work permit that bears a photograph or any other proof of identity	June 17, 2001: Vetoed by Governor.

		satisfactory to the Department.	
Utah	HB 187	Becomes class C misdemeanor to alter date on driver's license or to use a false or modified identification card.	Signed by Governor: March 18, 2002.
	HB 101	Requires race information be provided at application for driver's license or identification card.	Bill substituted now requires law enforcement agencies to adopt policies against unconstitutional traffic stops (February 7, 2002).
	SB 133	Allows a driver license or identification card applicant to provide an affidavit if they do not qualify for Social Security number or temporary identification number; requires an applicant for a driver license or identification card to provide a Utah residence address.	Defeated March 6, 2002.
	HB 350	Repeals provision allowing IRS temporary identification number at application for driver's license. Bill further requires applicants to provide Utah residence address.	Died March 6, 2002.
Vermont	HB 588	Requires the department of motor vehicles, at the time of issuing a motor vehicle operator's license, to check the identity and background of the applicant through the National Crime Information Center and the Social Security Administration.	Passed House March 20, 2002. March 22, 2002: read first time in Senate.
Virginia	HB 14	Increases fraudulently obtaining or aiding another in fraudulently obtaining a state driver's license from a Class 2 misdemeanor to a Class 4 felony. Requires legal presence in the United States to obtain a license or identification card and ties expiration date to the date of legal presence.	Incorporated by HB 638: February 5, 2002.

	HB 637	Requires the Department of State Police and the Department of Motor Vehicles to enter into agreements with the US Department of State, the INS and other federal law-enforcement agencies to bring about the interchange of information concerning those aliens residing in the US who hold or apply for Virginia driver's licenses.	Approved by Governor: April 2, 2002 (Chap. 412).
	HB 638	Using false identification for any purpose other than engaging in age limiting activity becomes a Class 6 felony. Prohibits the use of immigration visas and written statements for proof of Virginia residency. Allows for individual's under the age of 19 to show proof of their parent's residency as proof of their own. Directs the Director of the DMV to study and report back any other modifications that may be needed to enhance the identification and residency requirements.	Approved by Governor: April 7, 2002 (Chap. 767).
	HB 798	Requires non-U.S. citizen applicants for driver's license to submit a fingerprint.	Carried over to 2003
	SB 62	Requires thumbprint or other biometric for application for driver's license	Passed Senate: January 30, 2002. Failed in House: February 21, 2002.
	SB 162	Identical to HB 638	Approved by Governor (Chap. 834).
	SB 376	SB 62.	Incorporated by SB 62: January 24, 2002.
	HB 415	Requires applicants for driver's licenses, commercial driver's licenses, temporary driver's permits, learner's permits, motorcycle learner's permits, and special identification cards to submit documentary proof of their name, date of birth, and Virginia residency.	Incorporated by HB 638 (enacted). February 5, 2002.

	HB 630	Creates class 1 misdemeanor for creating for another a forged or false driver's license.	Tabled in Committee: January 21, 2002.
Vermont	SB 298	Bill, as introduced, added language that tied expiration of driver's licenses to the expiration of visa. Entire bill was struck and replaced through a Senate amendment.	Passed Senate: April 16, 2002. Amended in House: May 16, 2002.
Washington	HB 2420	Improves the security of Washington state driver's licenses by verifying the citizenship or legal residence of applicants for driver's licenses in Washington and verifying the Social Security numbers of applicants for driver's licenses in Washington.	Referred to Select Committee on Community Security: January 16, 2002.
Wisconsin	AB 789	Requires DOT to take a thumbprint of all applicants for driver's licenses and identification cards.	March 26, 2002: Failed to pass.

 [Transportation Protection Democracy page](#)

Visitor counts for this page.

National Conference of State Legislatures
INFO@NCSL.ORG (autoresponse directory)

Denver Office:
 7700 East First Place
 Denver, CO 80230
 Tel: 303-364-7700
 Fax: 303-364-7800

Washington Office:
 444 North Capitol Street, N.W., Suite 515
 Washington, D.C. 20001
 Tel: 202-624-5400
 Fax: 202-737-1069

Appendix C: Vehicle Valuation Sample

<u>Entry Number</u>	<u>Vehicle Make</u>	<u>Vehicle Model</u>	<u>Vehicle Value</u>	<u>Vehicle Year</u>	<u>Actual Sale Price</u>
1	mercury	cougar	\$600.00	1984	\$295.00
2	toyota	pickup	\$4,120.00	1993	\$1.00
3	chevrolet	monte carlo	\$1,800.00	1988	\$100.00
4	ford	ranger	\$800.00	1988	\$100.00
5	chrysler	lebaron	\$800.00	1992	\$100.00
6	gmc	k24 2600	\$2,450.00	1988	\$100.00
7	jeo	tracker	\$830.00	1992	\$100.00
8	chevrolet	s10	\$1,870.00	1994	\$100.00
9	ford	bronco	\$2,860.00	1986	\$100.00
10	ford	taurus	\$3,780.00	1998	\$100.00
11				1978	\$100.00
12	gmc	s15	\$1,360.00	1985	\$100.00
13	nissan	rd05	\$500.00	1982	\$100.00
14				1979	\$100.00
15	ford	escort	\$1,440.00	1995	\$100.00
16	chevrolet	celebrity	\$500.00	1985	\$100.00
17	gmc	k14	\$1,425.00	1985	\$100.00
18				1980	\$100.00
19	isuzu	rodeo	\$3,220.00	1994	\$100.00
20	plymouth	ecclaim	\$950.00	1991	\$100.00
21	ford	ranger	\$500.00	1985	\$100.00
22	chevrolet	cavalier	\$500.00	1991	\$100.00
23	ford	bronco	\$900.00	1983	\$100.00
24	ford	ranger	\$8,595.00	2000	\$100.00
25	chevrolet	cavalier	\$800.00	1990	\$100.00
26	buick	regal	\$800.00	1984	\$100.00
27	ford	ranger	\$925.00	1988	\$100.00
28				1979	\$100.00
29	chevrolet	pickup	\$1,700.00	1986	\$100.00
30	gmc	safari	\$2,800.00	1991	\$100.00
31	chevrolet	celebrity	\$800.00	1987	\$100.00
32	toyota	camry	\$7,920.00	1999	\$100.00
33				1978	\$100.00
34				1979	\$100.00
35				1979	\$100.00
36	dodge	dakota	\$950.00	1987	\$100.00
37				1979	\$100.00
38				1975	\$100.00
39				1976	\$100.00
40	pontiac	grand am	\$800.00	1989	\$100.00
41	chevrolet	corsica	\$600.00	1990	\$100.00
42				1978	\$100.00
43	plymouth	voyager	\$3,735.00	1996	\$100.00
44	buick	electra park	\$800.00	1985	\$100.00
45	ford	escort	\$6,300.00	2001	\$100.00
46	chevrolet	blazer	\$3,330.00	1993	\$100.00
47	dodge	omni america	\$600.00	1989	\$100.00
48	ford	festiva	\$600.00	1988	\$100.00
49	plymouth	voyager	\$600.00	1989	\$100.00
50	chevrolet	cavalier	\$600.00	1987	\$100.00
51	chevrolet	monte carlo	\$4,815.00	1996	\$100.00
52	oldsmobile	delta	\$1,550.00	1989	\$100.00
53	hyundai	liburon	\$3,805.00	1997	\$100.00
54				1979	\$100.00
55	mercury	sable	\$3,535.00	1996	\$100.00
56	acura	legend	\$1,800.00	1987	\$100.00
57				1966	\$100.00
58	saab	s4j	\$800.00	1988	\$100.00
59	honda	f33 crx	\$800.00	1984	\$100.00
60	pontiac	grand prix	\$2,525.00	1991	\$100.00
61	oldsmobile	cutlass tier	\$850.00	1978	\$100.00
62	oldsmobile	cutlass tier	\$850.00	1990	\$100.00
63	ford	escort pony	\$800.00	1988	\$100.00
64	chevrolet	nova	\$800.00	1988	\$100.00
65				1978	\$100.00
66				1984	\$100.00
67	chevrolet	celebrity	\$600.00	1987	\$100.00
68	chevrolet	cavalier	\$600.00	1990	\$100.00

69	chevrolet	c19 1500	\$7,180.00	1997	\$100.00
70	chevrolet	corsica	\$600.00	1988	\$100.00
71				1977	\$100.00
72	chevrolet	caprice classic	\$600.00	1986	\$100.00
73	pontiac	firebird	\$2,075.00	1990	\$100.00
74	chevrolet	silverado	\$10,980.00	2000	\$100.00
76	chevrolet	cavalier	\$600.00	1991	\$100.00
76	chrysler	new yorker	\$600.00	1985	\$125.00
77	chrysler	new yorker	\$1,250.00	1988	\$150.00
78	chevrolet	celebrity	\$600.00	1984	\$150.00
79	ford	mustang	\$600.00	1987	\$150.00
80	mercury	marquis grand	\$1,200.00	1988	\$150.00
81	chevrolet	s10	\$850.00	1983	\$150.00
82	ford	ltd wagon	\$600.00	1986	\$150.00
83	pontiac	sunbird	\$1,200.00	1991	\$150.00
84	nissan	pickup	\$600.00	1987	\$150.00
85	geo	metro	\$835.00	1993	\$150.00
86	nissan	stanza	\$1,175.00	1991	\$195.00
87				1978	\$200.00
88	honda	accord	\$1,950.00	1989	\$200.00
89	ford	mustang	\$600.00	1987	\$200.00
90	ford	tempo	\$600.00	1989	\$200.00
91	dodge	daytona	\$600.00	1988	\$200.00
92				1987	\$200.00
93	buick	skylark	\$600.00	1987	\$200.00
94				1978	\$200.00
95	buick	skylark	\$600.00	1991	\$200.00
96				1978	\$200.00
97	mazda	pickup	\$1,800.00	1991	\$200.00
98	mercury	topaz	\$970.00	1994	\$200.00
99	dodge	caravan	\$850.00	1990	\$200.00
100	ford	taurus	\$1,000.00	1989	\$200.00
101	ford	escorline	\$4,615.00	1983	\$200.00
102	dodge	caravan	\$600.00	1990	\$200.00
103				1977	\$200.00
104	chevrolet	beretta	\$1,050.00	1989	\$200.00
105	FORD	TEMPO GL	\$600.00	1987	\$200.00
106	CHEVROLET	P87S CAMARO	\$600.00	1985	\$200.00
107	CHEVROLET	S11 S10	\$750.00	1988	\$200.00
108	FORD	A11 AEROSTAR WAG	\$600.00	1986	\$200.00
109	PONTIAC	WJST GRAND PRIX L	\$1,550.00	1990	\$200.00
110	TOYOTA	380 PICKUP 4X4	\$600.00	1982	\$200.00
111	OLDSMOBILE	M19R CUTLASS CIFR	\$600.00	1985	\$200.00
112				1977	\$200.00
113	PLYMOUTH	PS14 SUNDANCE	\$600.00	1987	\$200.00
114	OLDSMOBILE	Y897 DELTA 88	\$600.00	1984	\$200.00
115	CHEVROLET	LV10 BFRFTTA	\$1,225.00	1991	\$200.00
116	TOYOTA	380 TEROFI	\$600.00	1989	\$200.00
117	CHEVROLET	SK64 NOVA	\$600.00	1987	\$200.00
118	TOYOTA	82E COROLLA	\$600.00	1985	\$200.00
119	GMC	T11 SONOMA	\$2,325.00	1991	\$200.00
120				1975	\$200.00
121	FORD	GRANADA I	\$500.00	1981	\$200.00
122	CHEVROLET	JCSG CAVALIER	\$600.00	1990	\$200.00
123	TOYOTA	63R PICKUP 4X4	\$600.00	1987	\$200.00
124				1987	\$200.00
125	TOYOTA	RNB1 PICKUP 4X2	\$1,195.00	1993	\$200.00
126	FORD	J/X TEMPO LX	\$600.00	1987	\$200.00
127				1978	\$200.00
128	FORD	F14 F 150	\$1,850.00	1985	\$200.00
129	CHEVROLET	FP2E CAMARO RS	\$2,850.00	1991	\$250.00
130	VOLKSWAGON	CG1G JETTA	\$600.00	1986	\$250.00
131	FORD	R11 RANGER	\$3,150.00	1993	\$250.00
132				1973	\$260.00
133	FORD	21C PROBF	\$1,325.00	1989	\$260.00
134	NISSAN	HU11 MAXIMA	\$1,825.00	1987	\$260.00
135	CHEVROLET	N69H CAPRICE CLAS	\$600.00	1983	\$250.00
136	CHEVROLET	G25 CHEVYVAN	\$850.00	1990	\$250.00
137				1980	\$250.00

138	PONTIAC	NE13 GRAND AM SE	\$1,755.00	1994	\$250.00
139	CHEVROLET	JF1W CAVALIER L24	\$975.00	1988	\$275.00
140	CHEVROLET	S14 S10	\$800.00	1981	\$300.00
141	PLYMOUTH	PA48 ACCI AIM	\$950.00	1991	\$300.00
142	FORD	AEROSTAR WAG	\$800.00	1996	\$300.00
143	OLDSMOBILE	NT27 CALAIS SUPRE	\$800.00	1996	\$300.00
144	FORD	38X TEMPO CI	\$1,000.00	1991	\$300.00
145	SUBARU	BC63 LEGACY	\$2,025.00	1991	\$300.00
146	CHEVROLET	LTS6 CORSICA	\$800.00	1990	\$300.00
147	CHEVROLET	R16 SUBURBAN 4X2	\$3,475.00	1988	\$300.00
148	CHEVROLET	S14 S10	\$800.00	1987	\$300.00
149	SUBARU	M53 SUBARU GL	\$800.00	1984	\$300.00
150	MERCURY	75S TOPAZ	\$800.00	1986	\$300.00
151	CHEVROLET	S14 S10	\$750.00	1986	\$300.00
152	CHEVROLET	AW8W CELEBRITY	\$600.00	1987	\$300.00
153	NISSAN	GB21 SENTRA	\$700.00	1989	\$300.00
154	SUBARU	N53 SUBARU GL	\$1,476.00	1988	\$300.00
155	CHEVROLET	LV1M BERETTA	\$1,870.00	1974	\$300.00
156				1978	\$300.00
157	BUICK	CW51 ELECTRA PARK	\$3,000.00	1991	\$300.00
158	PONTIAC	TN56 LEMANS	\$600.00	1989	\$300.00
159	FORD	R10 RANGER 4X2	\$625.00	1988	\$300.00
160				1979	\$300.00
161	FORD	319 ESCORT PONY	\$800.00	1986	\$300.00
162	PONTIAC	TX26 LEMANS	\$800.00	1991	\$300.00
163	DODGE	BP44 SHADOW	\$800.00	1990	\$300.00
164	FORD	14J ESCORT LX	\$1,060.00	1992	\$300.00
165	FORD	R10 RANGER 4X2	\$800.00	1983	\$300.00
166	DODGE	RL18 OMNI AMERICA	\$600.00	1989	\$300.00
167	FORD	06H ASPIRE	\$810.00	1994	\$300.00
168	PLYMOUTH	PP24 SUNDANCE AME	\$600.00	1991	\$300.00
169	CHEVROLET	M16 ASTRO 4X2	\$875.00	1990	\$300.00
170	FORD	F14 F-150	\$2,450.00	1987	\$300.00
171	JEEP	25 PICKUP J 4X4	\$600.00	1994	\$300.00
172	CHEVROLET	LV14 BERETTA	\$1,845.00	1992	\$300.00
173	BUICK	CW6C ELECTRA PARK	\$2,500.00	1990	\$350.00
174	CHEVROLET	JE11 CAVALIER RS	\$800.00	1987	\$350.00
175	VOLKSWAGON	AG17 RABBIT	\$600.00	1983	\$350.00
176	ISUZU	GL11 PICKUP 4X2	\$600.00	1988	\$350.00
177	BUICK	H18R CENTURY CUSI	\$600.00	1985	\$350.00
178	DODGE	B11 RAMWAGON 4X2	\$1,300.00	1987	\$350.00
179	PONTIAC	NE1U GRAND AM LE	\$650.00	1989	\$400.00
180	NISSAN	HU11 MAXIMA	\$1,825.00	1987	\$400.00
181	GEO	SK5 PRIZM	\$1,275.00	1990	\$400.00
182	HONDA	J814 CIVIC EX	\$7,540.00	1998	\$400.00
183	CHEVROLET	JC54 CAVALIER	\$2,725.00	1996	\$400.00
184				1974	\$400.00
185	OMC	M19 SAFARI	\$3,176.00	1993	\$400.00
186	BUICK	WB1T REGAL CUSTOM	\$1,225.00	1990	\$400.00
187	HONDA	A553 ACCORD SEDAN	\$2,500.00	1988	\$400.00
188				1977	\$400.00
189	CHEVROLET	JC11 CAVALIER	\$600.00	1986	\$400.00
190	TOYOTA	VZ2F CAMRY LC	\$3,250.00	1990	\$400.00
191	FORD	ESCORT	\$1,845.00	1995	\$400.00
192	PLYMOUTH	PM44 TOURISMO	\$800.00	1988	\$400.00
193	CHEVROLET	LV1W BERETTA	\$775.00	1988	\$400.00
194	FORD	X25 F-250	\$875.00	1981	\$400.00
195	CHEVROLET	AW5W CELEBRITY	\$800.00	1987	\$400.00
196	NISSAN	L1M05 STANZA	\$975.00	1987	\$400.00
197	CHEVROLET	L11B BLAZER T10 4	\$2,350.00	1989	\$400.00
198	PONTIAC	WP1W GRAND PRIX 5	\$1,600.00	1989	\$400.00
199	CHEVROLET	JD61 CAVALIER GS	\$800.00	1987	\$400.00
200	CHEVROLET	RF27 SPECTRUM	\$800.00	1990	\$400.00
201	CHEVROLET	M15 ASTRO VAN 4X	\$800.00	1988	\$400.00
202	NISSAN	GB22 SENTRA	\$800.00	1989	\$400.00
203	FORD	R10 RANGER 4X2	\$800.00	1985	\$400.00
204	MERCURY	653 MYSTIQUE	\$2,835.00	1996	\$400.00
205	TOYOTA	67S PICKUP 4X4	\$2,025.00	1987	\$400.00
206	CHEVROLET	GZ1H MONTE CARLO	\$1,450.00	1986	\$400.00

207	FORD	HUNDEBIRD	\$1,845.00	1993	\$450.00
208				1977	\$150.00
209	Ford	Probe	\$1,970.00	1994	\$150.00
210	Chevrolet	Beretta	\$776.00	1988	\$476.00
211	Chevrolet	Cavalier	\$1,750.00	1994	\$600.00
212	Ford	Taurus	\$4,850.00	1989	\$600.00
213	Ford	F-150	\$3,150.00	1989	\$600.00
214	Dodge	Club 4x4	\$6,910.00	1985	\$500.00
215	Ford	Taurus	\$600.00	1987	\$500.00
216	Chevrolet	Cavalier	\$600.00	1990	\$500.00
217	Mercury	Grand Marquis	\$750.00	1987	\$500.00
218	Chevrolet	4x4	\$750.00	1972	\$500.00
219	Ford	Festiva	\$520.00	1993	\$500.00
220	Chevrolet	Cavalier	\$600.00	1986	\$500.00
221	Dodge	Spirit	\$1,485.00	1993	\$500.00
222	Ford	Econoline	\$600.00	1987	\$500.00
223	Chevrolet	Astro Van	\$975.00	1986	\$500.00
224	Ford	Tempo	\$990.00	1993	\$500.00
225	Chevrolet	4x4	\$2,300.00	1987	\$500.00
226	Dodge	Omni	\$600.00	1989	\$500.00
227	Pontiac	Transport	\$2,430.00	1994	\$500.00
228	Oldsmobile	96	\$2,925.00	1990	\$500.00
229	Chevrolet	Blazer	\$1,625.00	1987	\$500.00
230	Chevrolet	1500	\$20,385.00	1994	\$500.00
231	Chevrolet	210 4x4	\$1,225.00	1991	\$500.00
232	Ford	Taurus	\$600.00	1987	\$500.00
233	Plymouth	Neon	\$1,755.00	1995	\$500.00
234	Chevrolet	Blazer	\$2,410.00	1992	\$500.00
235	Chevrolet	Geo Tracker	\$1,080.00	1993	\$500.00
236	Chevrolet		\$100.00	1977	\$500.00
237	Ford	Taurus	\$3,285.00	1996	\$500.00
238	Pontiac	Sunbird	\$1,665.00	1993	\$500.00
239	Pontiac	Firebird	\$2,375.00	1987	\$500.00
240	Oldsmobile	Omega	\$600.00	1983	\$500.00
241	Ford	Ranger	\$1,725.00	1989	\$500.00
242	Ford	Ranger	\$1,175.00	1986	\$500.00
243	Dodge	Intrepid	\$4,075.00	1997	\$500.00
244	Chevrolet	Pickup 4x4	\$500.00	1982	\$500.00
245	Ford	Taurus	\$1,915.00	1994	\$500.00
246	Honda	Prelude	\$2,700.00	1987	\$500.00
247	Chevrolet	S10 4x4	\$1,150.00	1986	\$500.00
248	Ford		\$100.00	1979	\$500.00
249	Chevrolet	Geo Tracker	\$725.00	1991	\$500.00
250	Toyota	Pickup 4x4	\$600.00	1984	\$500.00
251	Mercury	Grand Marquis	\$600.00	1985	\$500.00
252	Mercury	Grand Marquis	\$600.00	1992	\$500.00
253	Ford	Ranger 4x4	\$1,175.00	1986	\$500.00
254	Ford	Tempo	\$1,000.00	1991	\$500.00
255	Dodge	Pickup 4x4	\$1,800.00	1986	\$500.00
256	Toyota	Celica	\$3,925.00	1992	\$500.00
257	Chevrolet		\$100.00	1978	\$500.00
258	Mitsubishi	Mirage	\$600.00	1990	\$500.00
259	Pontiac	Sunbird	\$2,025.00	1990	\$500.00
260	Chevrolet	Cavalier	\$6,025.00	1997	\$500.00
261	Ford	F-150	\$726.00	1982	\$500.00
262	Ford	F-350	\$600.00	1981	\$500.00
263	Chevrolet	Pickup 4x2	\$700.00	1986	\$500.00
264	Chrysler	New Yorker	\$975.00	1988	\$500.00
265	Oldsmobile	Cutless Supreme	\$1,750.00	1990	\$500.00
266	Jeep	Cherokee	\$4,950.00	1990	\$500.00
267	Plymouth	Voyager	\$1,015.00	1992	\$300.00
268	Ford	Tempo	\$600.00	1989	\$500.00
269	Chevrolet	Suburban	\$5,075.00	1990	\$500.00
270	Mazda	Protege	\$625.00	1990	\$500.00
271	Pontiac	Firebird	\$500.00	1981	\$500.00
272	Chevrolet	Camaro	\$600.00	1983	\$500.00
273	Ford	F-150	\$7,765.00	1998	\$500.00
274	Chevrolet	Beretta	\$650.00	1990	\$500.00
275	Chevrolet	Cavalier	\$600.00	1990	\$500.00

276	Chevrolet	Blazer	\$600.00	1983	\$500.00
277	Chevrolet		\$100.00	1972	\$500.00
278	Toyota	Camry	\$2,450.00	1990	\$500.00
279	Oldsmobile	Cutlass Supreme	\$1,000.00	1989	\$500.00
280	Chevrolet	Corsica	\$600.00	1988	\$500.00
281	Toyota	Celica	\$4,275.00	1992	\$500.00
281					
282					

Appendix D: ABCA Response



STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA ALCOHOL BEVERAGE CONTROL ADMINISTRATION

322 70th Street, SE
Charleston, West Virginia 25304-2060

BOB WISE
GOVERNOR

THOMAS A. KEELEY
COMMISSIONER

BRIAN M. KASTICK
SECRETARY OF TAX & REVENUE

January 3, 2003

David Mullins
Research Manager
West Virginia Legislature
Performance Evaluation and Research Division
Building 1, Room W-314
1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East
Charleston, WV 25305-0610

Dear Mr. Rhodes:

Through this letter, I would like to clarify the response provided in my correspondence of July 16, 2002 regarding the use of ultraviolet features on West Virginia driver's licenses. The Alcohol Beverage Control Administration ("ABCA") believes that the use of ultraviolet technology would be a valuable tool in detecting fake IDs.

In this regard, the ABCA supports the development and use of new technology to reduce underage consumption of alcohol and the use of fake IDs and therefore supports the steps of the West Virginia DMV. Further, I commend the measures taken by DMV Commissioner, Roger Pritt, in this matter.

The ABCA considers violations relating to the sale of beer and other alcoholic beverages to individuals under the age of 21 very serious. The WV ABCA has made this a priority area of enforcement and therefore any steps utilized to ensure that beer, or other alcoholic beverages are not sold to underage individuals is supported by the ABCA. The ABCA welcomes and embraces any aid that the DMV can provide this agency against the fight to control underage drinking.

Sincerely,

Thomas A. Keeley
Commissioner, WV ABCA

TAK:abs

Appendix E: Agency Response



WEST VIRGINIA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
Division of Motor Vehicles

1800 Kanawha Boulevard East • Building Three
Charleston, West Virginia 25317-0010

Bob Wise
Governor

Fred VanKirk, P. E.
Secretary

Roger Pritt
Commissioner

January 2, 2003

John Sylvia, Director
Performance Evaluation and Research Division
West Virginia Legislature
Building 1, Room W-314
Charleston, WV 25305-0610

Dear Mr. Sylvia:

Thank you for the opportunity to respond to the most recent component of the Full Performance Evaluation of the Division of Motor Vehicles. The most recent audit findings relate to driver's license identity documents and collection of privilege tax on vehicles. I respond to each of the findings as follows:

1. The Division of Motor Vehicles should consider all forms of legislation to prevent fraudulent driver's licenses and personal identification cards, such as requiring a picture ID for non residents to obtain a driver's license or tying non-residents driver's license expiration date with their visa.

DMV Response: The Agency agrees. DMV has proposed legislative rules, which are now pending before the Legislative Rule-Making Review Committee which, implement the following:

A. Require all applicants for original, renewal and duplicate driver's licenses to present proof of West Virginia residency and proof of identity.

B. Require all applicants who are not United States citizens to present "legal presence" documents from the Immigration and Naturalization Service which show that their presence in this country is authorized.

304-558-3900 • TDD 1-800-742-6991 • 1-800-642-9066
An Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action Employer

C. West Virginia already requires the social security card and birth certificate from each new and transfer driver's license applicant and utilizes facial imaging and the optional finger imaging to verify identity.

2. The Division of Motor Vehicles should consider the addition of an ultraviolet hologram to the West Virginia driver's license to counteract fraudulent use of identifications for underage drinking.

DMV Response: The Agency agrees and will consider the addition of an ultraviolet hologram to the driver's license when the present contract is rebid. The current license has a hologram but does not have the ultraviolet feature.

3. The Legislature should consider amending West Virginia Code §17A-3-4(l) by creating a minimum value for vehicle transactions at \$500 and set a flat rate on any transaction \$500 and below at \$25.

DMV Response: The Agency agrees.

4. The Division should audit vehicle transactions to determine the present market value to ensure that the proper tax is being paid by those conducting used vehicle transactions.

DMV Response: The Agency recognizes the value of a comprehensive audit program to verify vehicle values. However, with over 700,000 annual title transactions, this undertaking would require additional staff.

5. The Legislative Auditor recommends continuing the audit of the Division of Motor Vehicles in 2003.

DMV Response: The Agency looks forward to the continued audit and appreciates the assistance of the Legislative Auditor in improving DMV programs.

Sincerely,



Roger Prill
Commissioner

RP/sd