

JOINT SELECT COMMITTEE ON TAX REFORM

TOPIC: *Ad Valorem* Taxation of Coal Reserves and Machinery & Equipment used in Coal Mining

BY: John A. Mairs
Jackson Kelly PLLC
500 Lee St. E., Suite 1600
Charleston, WV 25301
Phone: (304)340-1230
Cell: (304)539-8130
jmairs@jacksonkelly.com

DATE: June 29, 2015

Overview

West Virginia Code §11-1C-10 provides that the Tax Commissioner is responsible for annually appraising all industrial and natural resource property located in West Virginia. Upon completion of each industrial and natural resource appraisal, the Tax Commissioner is required to forward the results of such appraisal to the county assessor of the county in which the property is located, who multiplies the appraisal by 60% and includes the resulting assessed value in the land book or personal property book of the county. The Tax Commissioner is responsible for supplying support data the assessor may need to explain or defend the appraisal. The Tax Commissioner is also responsible for defending any challenged natural resource property appraisal where the assessed value of the property exceeds \$2 million. In practice, the Tax Commissioner defends and assumes the cost of defending all challenged industrial and natural resource property appraisals throughout the state.

With regard to the coal industry, the Tax Commissioner annually appraises all coal in-place in West Virginia, as active or reserve coal property, pursuant to the methodology set forth in Legislative Rule 110 CSR 11-1 et seq. Assessments of in-place coal are issued in the name of the owner of the coal, but in reality, the producer or lessee typically pays such assessments. In addition, the Tax Commissioner annually appraises all buildings, real property improvements, machinery and equipment, coal inventories and other personal property used in the production of coal, as industrial property pursuant to the methodology set forth in Legislative Rule -- 110 CSR 1P.

Property Taxes Assessed on Real and Personal Property used in Coal Production

Because of the significant downturn in the coal industry in West Virginia, property taxes assessed coal reserves and on industrial property used to produce coal have fallen in recent years, but at a much slower pace than the decrease in production and coal prices over the same period. According to information provided by the Property Tax Division of the State Tax Department, between 2013 and 2014, the appraised value of coal reserves and industrial property used in coal production in West Virginia fell 11%, from \$12.4 billion to \$11.1 billion. Total property taxes assessed on active and reserve coal property and industrial property used in coal production for tax years 2013 and 2014, (the most recent years for which date is available), are set forth below.

<u>Year</u>	<u>Active Coal</u>	<u>Reserve Coal</u>	<u>M&E</u>	<u>Total</u>
2013	\$41,949,441	\$16,379,227	\$111,711,209	\$170,039,877
2014	\$40,663,735	\$8,855,775	\$101,813,496	\$151,333,006

As shown by the above data, the total property taxes paid by coal producers and owners and exceeded \$170 million in 2013. Approximately, 1/3 of these taxes were paid on active and reserve coal, while 2/3 was paid on industrial property used to produce the coal. Between 2013 and 2014, total property taxes assessed on coal producers and owners decreased by approximately 11% to \$151 million, with taxes on M&E falling by approximately 8.9%, while taxes on coal reserves fell over 14%. For 2013, taxes imposed on coal represented over 10% of all property tax paid in West Virginia. For 2014, this percentage had fallen to approximately 9.4%. A copy of the Property Tax Division's county-by-county summary of coal industry appraisals and property tax assessments is attached.

Because the methodology used by the Tax Commissioner to appraise active and reserve coal assigns the highest value to active mining property, the tax assessed on the coal associate with active mines fell only 2.9%. During that same period, the taxes assessed on reserve coal property fell by over 45%. Similarly, the taxes assessed on M&E would have fallen by a greater amount, except that the Tax Commissioner has historically limited the amount of relief that he has been willing to grant on personal property located at idle mines, to 50% of the appraised value of similar equipment located at operating mines.

Appraisal of Active and Reserve Coal Property for *Ad Valorem* Property Tax Purposes.

The Tax Commissioner annually appraises all active and reserve coal property in the state pursuant to the valuation methods set forth in Legislative Rule 110

CSR 11-1 et seq. (“Coal Rule”). The Coal Rule was developed and recommended to the Tax Commissioner and the Legislature by consultants hired by the Tax Commissioner. The Coal Rule was developed as part of the settlement of a lawsuit challenging the coal appraisal method used at that time. The Coal Rule was originally approved by the Legislature, effective May 1, 1999. It was updated and reapproved, effective May 1, 2006.

The Tax Commissioner employs separate valuation procedures for appraising active mining property, reserves, unmineable, mined-out and barren properties. For assessment purposes, the statutes and regulations direct the Tax Commissioner to appraise active and reserve coal and to attribute the value of the coal to the owner of the coal property. The Coal Rule is essentially an income-based appraisal methodology that estimates the fair market value of the coal by projecting when mining will occur and the income that will be earned by the coal owner when the coal is mined. The projected income stream is discounted to present value to determine the fair market value of the coal in-place. Under the coal rule, properties being actively mined receive the highest values, reserves are appraised a lower values based on when production is projected to occur and unmineable, mined out and barren properties are appraised at nominal values.

Appraisal of Active Mining Property. The term Active Mining Property means a mineable bed of coal on a property or portion of a property involved in an active mining operation. Each bed of coal being mined in a permitted mining operation is appraised as a separate active mining property. The fair market value of coal seams

associated with an active mining property is determined based on the premise that the value of the coal to the property owner is equal to the present value of the stream of royalty payments that the owner will receive when the property is mined.

The actual appraisal of in-place coal associated with an active mine is computed using complicated formulas set out in the Coal Rule, which rely on variables such as the weighted average annual production of the mine, the size and seam characteristics of the property, average industry steam and metallurgical coal royalty rates and average coal prices. Using these formulas, the Tax Commissioner determines an estimated mine life and royalty stream for each active mining property. The fair market value of the coal associated with the active mine is then determined by discounting the future stream of income to the property owner to present value.

The capitalization rate used by the Tax Commissioner to determine the present value of future coal production plays a critical role in the ultimate appraised value assigned not only to active mine property but also to reserve property. That Tax Commissioner annually computes the capitalization rate based on the methodology set forth in the Coal Rule. For Tax Year 2015, the capitalization rate was set at 12%. There is wide spread agreement within the industry that this rate is too low; that it does not accurately reflect the risk on engaging in the coal business; and that the use of the 12% rate results in the significant over-appraisal of active and reserve coal throughout the State.

In summary, the value of in-place coal associated with an active mining property is determined using formulas, which equate the value of the coal with the

present value of the stream of royalty payments that would be received by the property owner upon mining of the property. Using the formulas set forth in the Coal Rule, the total appraised value of active mine properties for 2013 and 2014 was approximately \$3 billion.

Appraisal of Reserve Coal Property. Reserve coal property is property containing one or more mineable coal seams, which are not being actively mined. Reserve coal property is valued based on the Reserve Coal Valuation Model (RCVM), set forth in the Coal Rule. Under the RCVM, the Tax Department has developed a Geographical Information System (GIS) database, which contains coal bed maps, mine maps, reserve coal bed locations, seam thicknesses, BTU data, sulfur content and other information relevant to determining the location and quality of coal beds in this State. The RCVM database identifies over 80 separate coal beds in West Virginia and includes the coal characteristics, property locations, mine locations, sales prices, transportation availability, etc. for coal over the entire State. The database tracks approximately 200,000 coal parcels for appraisal. Using the GIS database, the Tax Commissioner is able to estimate the location, size and quality of mineable coal beds at locations throughout the state and calculate in-place tonnage, expected time of mining and present value for all mineable coal seams on each separate parcel.

The methodology used to appraise reserve coal is similar to the appraisal method used to value active coal. Like the method used to appraise active mining property, the fair market value of reserve coal beds in the State is determined using an

income-based approach. The key factor in preparing an income-based valuation of reserve coal is in the determination of when the coal is expected to be mined.

The RCVM evaluates six factors, to project when a reserve bed will be mined. These factors include: 1) market interest in the coal bed; 2) current and historical mining activity in the area; 3) determination of prime coal bed status; 4) environmental problems associated with the property or area; 5) conflicts with other mining; and 6) volatility content of the coal itself. Based on this analysis, each coal parcel is assigned a "coal bed index factor" that predicts, for appraisal purposes, that coal bed will be mined in 20, 40 or 80 years. Historically, properties that are assigned a coal bed index factor of 20 have been tentatively appraised at approximately \$1,000 per seam acre. Properties assigned a coal bed index factor of 40 have been tentatively appraised at \$100 per seam acre and properties assigned a coal bed index factor of 80 have been tentatively appraised at \$5 per seam acre.

Adjustment of Tentative Reserve Appraisals using Aggregate Value Formula. In today's coal market the actual appraisals of reserve coal are much lower than the tentative values predicted by the RCVM model. The Coal Rule contains a formula (Aggregate Value) that annually estimates the total value of all coal in place in West Virginia. In summary, the Aggregate Value formula assumes that coal will continue to be produced in the future at the current production rate and will be sold at the current market price. The resulting income stream is multiplied by the average royalty rate and discounted to present value to determine the total value of all coal in place in West Virginia.

The Coal Rule requires that the total annual appraised value of all active and reserve coal properties in the State equal the Aggregate Value. This requirement is met by making an adjustment increasing or decreasing the tentative appraisals of reserve properties until the total appraised value of active and reserve property equals the Aggregate Value. The following procedure is used to equalize and adjust the tentative reserve values. The term Aggregate Reserve Value is defined as the Aggregate Value of all unmined coal in West Virginia, less the total appraised value of all active mining properties as determined by the Tax Commissioner. The final RCVM value of reserve coal in West Virginia is determined as follows:

1. The tentative values of each individual reserve coal property located throughout the state are summed to produce the "Reserve Coal Index".
2. The Aggregate Reserve Value is then divided by the Reserve Coal Index to produce a fraction - the Aggregate Reserve Ratio.
3. The tentative value of each separate reserve property is then multiplied by the Aggregate Reserve Ratio to determine the actual appraised value of that coal bed or a particular parcel of property for the tax year.

In times of high coal prices and expanding production, the application of the above rules is expected to produce an Aggregate Reserve Ratio that increases tentative appraisals of reserve properties. In time of falling coal prices and contracting production as we have seen in recent years, application of the above formula results in a reduction in tentative reserve values. An example of how this rule works can be seen in information presented earlier with regard to property taxes assessed on active and reserve

coal properties for tax years 2013 and 2014. Between 2013 and 2014, both production and coal prices fell in West Virginia. While the reduction in the total taxes assessed on active mining property was modest (-3%), the decrease in the Aggregate Value formula significantly reduced the Aggregate Reserve Ratio, which caused property taxes assessed on reserve property to fall by almost 50%. Under the Coal Rule, changes in the coal market will disproportionately impact the owners of reserve coal who do not have a current royalty-based income stream to fund the annual increases and decreases in their property tax liability.

Appraisal of Machinery & Equipment and Improvements to Real Property Used in the Production of Coal as Industrial Property.

In addition to the annual appraisal of active mining property and reserve coal property, the Tax Commissioner appraises all buildings, real property improvements, machinery and equipment, replacement parts and supplies inventories and other personal property used in the production of coal, as industrial property. Legislative Rule – 110 CSR 1P (“Industrial Property Rule”) governing the valuation of commercial and industrial real and personal property was enacted effective July 26, 1991. Pursuant to the Industrial Property Rule, the Tax Commissioner annually appraises all preparation plants, coal-loading facilities, machinery and equipment, parts and supplies inventories and other classes of real and personal property used in production of coal.

Rolling stock, rock trucks, loaders, continuous miners, roof bolters, shuttle cars, scoops, and similar surface and underground mining equipment are appraised by the Tax Commissioner using the Green Guide, a nationally recognized source of information

regarding the valuation of used machinery and equipment. Typically, the Tax Commissioner appraises such machinery and equipment at operating mines at the "Good" value in the Green Guide. Many mining companies contend that in the mining industry, equipment is subjected to harder and more continuous use, in more difficult conditions than similar property used in the construction industry. Accordingly, such taxpayers submit that the appropriate value of such property should be the "Fair" value as set forth in the Green Guide.

Industrial facilities such as coal preparation plants, load-outs and storage facilities are annually appraised as industrial property. The Tax Commissioner primarily relies on the cost approach to value such assets. Accordingly, the current fair market value of industrial assets are determined by trending up the historic cost to purchase or construct such facilities, and depreciating that value to arrive at fair market value. Trend-up and Depreciation data for such appraisals are provided to the Tax Commissioner by the Marshall Valuation Service.

Pursuant to the Industrial Property Rule, the Tax Commissioner is required to consider economic and functional obsolescence in his industrial appraisals. The Industrial Property Rule was amended effective July 1, 2013 to incorporate a special obsolescence rule applicable to industrial facilities that are shut down as of the assessment date. The revised rule provides that when a facility is temporarily shut down, the Tax Commissioner will consider an income approach to valuation and discount the assessment based on the anticipated restart date. The revised rule further provides that when facility is shut down indefinitely, personal property should be appraised

considering an orderly sale of the property, either at market value or at salvage or scrap value. Prior to the revision of the regulations, the Tax Commissioner was only willing to reduce his appraised values by 50%, to account for the reduction in value due to the shutdown of the facility.

Industrial property used in the production of coal is appraised by the Tax Commissioner separately from and in addition to his appraisal of in-place active and reserve coal. As set forth above, the total appraised value of mining equipment valued as industrial property for Tax Year 2013 was \$8.1 billion. For Tax Year 2014, this value fell by 11% to \$7.4 billion.

COUNTY	GROUNDING COAL	RESERVE COAL	INDUSTRIAL APPRAISED VALUE	TOTAL COAL VALUE	PRODUCING COAL TAXES	RESERVE COAL TAXES	INDUSTRIAL TAXES	TOTAL COAL TAXES	TAX YEAR 2013
BARBOUR	47,399,216	46,250,432	89,316,400	162,966,048	360,044	351,318	526,627	1,237,990	
BERKELEY		98,219	186,813,000	186,711,219	0	1,456	2,913,805	2,915,260	
BOONE	534,386,471	133,904,966	1,242,715,737	1,911,007,174	8,124,812	2,035,891	18,894,250	29,054,953	
BRAXTON	2,502,906	41,905,830	12,087,377	56,446,113	25,930	432,468	124,226	582,524	
BROOKE		1,044,558	1,087,790	2,142,348	0	16,634	17,481	34,115	
CABELL		288,054	540,861	828,715	0	4,768	8,950	13,719	
CALHOUN		310,796	4,230,488	4,541,284	0	3,087	42,161	45,258	
CLAY	5,531,677	50,162,466	68,476,740	124,170,883	53,702	486,877	564,772	1,205,451	
DODDRIDGE		2,603,789	4,603,417	7,207,216	0	39,604	70,018	109,622	
FAYETTE	77,496,295	58,685,826	292,260,118	428,442,238	1,189,878	901,062	4,487,362	6,578,302	
GILMER		5,847,217	0	5,847,217	0	65,080	0	65,080	
GRANT	21,042,253	16,477,224	37,119,895	74,639,372	171,462	134,266	302,453	608,162	
GREENBRIER	36,182,306	25,710,378	133,984,555	195,877,289	448,733	318,880	1,681,878	2,429,270	
HAMPSHIRE		109,274	0	109,274	0	913	0	913	
HANCOCK		195,593	0	195,593	0	3,168	0	3,168	
HARDY		56,732	0	56,732	0	534	0	534	
HARRISON	76,734,988	13,892,892	122,188,760	212,816,640	1,050,195	180,138	1,672,275	2,612,609	
JACKSON		349,211	1,489,617	1,838,828	0	8,211	22,228	27,439	
JEFFERSON		837	14,333	15,170	0	12	201	213	
KANAWHA	179,959,118	98,565,157	524,900,644	803,424,919	2,365,743	1,285,738	6,900,344	10,561,824	
LEWIS		9,484,936	928,671	10,411,507	0	104,643	10,213	114,756	
LINCOLN	68,436,972	37,955,873	47,456,906	163,849,751	1,024,091	587,972	710,145	2,302,208	
LOGAN	372,202,061	93,889,982	889,855,588	1,355,947,631	5,641,094	1,422,697	13,486,651	20,550,742	
MARION	145,864,822	22,869,015	330,431,713	499,165,550	2,145,963	336,449	4,861,311	7,343,724	
MARSHALL	321,947,976	24,243,076	506,661,507	652,652,559	4,241,887	319,427	8,675,772	11,237,185	
MASON	3,477,160	7,976,422	52,487,062	63,940,644	48,486	111,223	731,880	891,588	
MCDOWELL	116,694,948	76,313,496	500,453,416	693,461,860	1,473,657	963,839	6,320,727	6,758,423	
MERCER	828,531	1,631,158	9,472,089	11,931,778	11,314	22,275	129,351	162,940	
MINERAL	1,935,197	8,285,578	2,018,352	12,239,127	27,728	118,716	28,919	175,362	
MINGO	170,152,473	51,787,326	695,443,983	817,393,782	2,323,602	707,206	8,131,383	11,162,193	
MONONGALIA	101,993,188	18,999,993	247,496,299	368,489,460	1,190,261	221,730	2,888,282	4,300,272	
MONROE		25,951	0	25,951	0	319	0	319	
MORGAN		11,065	0	11,065	0	148	0	148	
NICHOLAS	123,769,733	54,315,177	363,887,124	531,972,034	1,398,123	612,676	3,991,847	6,000,645	
OHIO	4,689,655	1,995,791	184,124,348	200,809,794	63,479	27,015	2,627,667	2,718,161	
PENDLETON		10,568	0	10,568	0	86	0	86	
PLEASANTS		81,704	487,794	569,498	0	1,198	7,153	8,351	
POCAHONTAS		3,566,696	0	3,566,696	0	28,954	0	28,954	
PRESTON	1,202,992	7,973,620	15,895,982	25,072,594	12,603	83,532	166,526	282,660	
PUTNAM		3,147,000	16,641,207	19,788,207	0	47,564	251,515	299,079	
RALEIGH	223,472,699	89,683,743	579,269,709	892,426,151	3,293,094	1,321,580	8,536,118	13,150,792	
RANDOLPH	1,950,124	59,119,492	28,643,536	89,713,152	19,868	602,309	291,820	913,998	
RITCHIE		102,341	158,142	260,483	0	1,369	2,115	3,484	
ROANE		163,573	0	163,573	0	1,603	0	1,603	
SUMMERS		543,483	575,396	1,118,879	0	4,428	4,686	9,117	
TAYLOR	7,080,454	32,393,888	148,946,743	188,421,085	91,933	420,602	1,933,925	2,446,459	
TUCKER	15,110,296	2,248,589	267,365	17,616,250	123,119	16,322	2,097	143,537	
TYLER		370,756	335,628	706,282	0	5,205	4,711	9,916	
UPSHER	41,017,083	39,972,696	74,360,937	155,370,716	430,679	419,713	781,000	1,631,393	
WAYNE	147,564,034	10,470,322	261,567,596	419,601,952	2,050,550	145,496	3,634,743	6,830,789	
WEBSTER	14,443,805	37,487,201	2,414,395	54,345,401	117,688	305,448	19,672	442,806	
WETZEL	11,848,960	13,174,571	27,501,730	52,525,281	163,642	182,283	380,514	726,740	
WIRT		134,167	0	134,167	0	1,966	0	1,966	
WOOD		3,077	217,878	220,955	0	40	2,852	2,893	
WYOMING	159,937,425	67,980,048	478,832,062	706,749,535	2,267,593	963,621	5,788,881	10,020,295	
STATE TOTALS	3,036,855,818	1,274,871,835	8,078,430,488	12,390,158,141	41,949,441	16,379,227	111,711,209	170,039,877	

\$10M

COUNTY	PRODUCING COAL	RESERVE COAL	INDUSTRIAL APRAISED VALUE	TOTAL COAL VALUE	PRODUCING COAL TAXES	RESERVE COAL TAXES	INDUSTRIAL TAXES	TOTAL COAL TAXES	TAX YEAR 2014
BARBOUR	54,156,946	34,783,011	59,133,561	148,073,538	428,823	275,481	468,338	1,172,742	
BERKELEY	0	210,231	178,000	388,231	0	3,123	2,644	5,788	
BOONE	455,504,292	63,323,907	1,149,077,579	1,687,905,778	6,925,467	882,777	17,470,578	25,358,839	
BRAXTON	2,810,053	22,882,759	4,834,448	30,327,280	28,581	232,589	47,105	308,246	
BROOKE	0	487,712	5,283,667	5,771,379	0	7,828	84,803	92,631	
CABELL	0	267,335	654,535	921,870	0	4,305	10,541	14,846	
CALHOUN	0	312,179	4,412,518	4,724,697	0	3,106	43,899	47,001	
CLAY	12,212,008	26,076,793	29,952,671	68,241,472	118,554	253,154	290,781	662,488	
DODDRIDGE	0	1,416,762	5,054,237	6,470,999	0	21,141	75,419	96,560	
FAYETTE	87,102,918	27,809,588	278,925,724	391,838,230	1,399,959	426,822	4,250,256	6,019,833	
GILMER	0	3,115,619	989,190	4,084,809	0	34,677	10,787	45,464	
GRANT	31,621,496	13,517,558	28,993,619	74,132,673	257,852	110,141	296,239	604,032	
GREENBRIER	41,523,757	11,637,902	59,400,322	112,581,981	514,479	144,194	735,970	1,394,643	
HAMPSHIRE	0	190,685	0	190,685	0	1,594	0	1,594	
HANCOCK	0	239,548	0	239,548	0	3,898	0	3,898	
HARDY	0	106,994	0	106,994	0	1,007	0	1,007	
HARRISON	49,645,349	9,215,071	69,129,157	148,091,577	675,674	125,440	1,189,248	2,090,281	
JACKSON	0	203,368	1,443,528	1,646,894	0	3,035	21,540	24,575	
JEFFERSON	0	1,531	12,999	14,530	0	22	183	205	
KANAWHA	181,480,740	46,831,930	482,792,454	721,105,124	2,404,257	620,429	8,628,514	9,553,201	
LEWIS	0	6,373,913	930,944	7,304,857	0	70,253	10,281	80,514	
LINCOLN	44,506,588	20,677,962	48,844,292	114,028,842	662,258	307,688	728,803	1,696,749	
LOGAN	333,927,331	51,219,110	871,785,981	1,256,932,422	5,061,003	778,277	13,212,788	19,050,068	
MARION	152,382,048	13,136,609	352,480,374	517,979,031	2,260,131	194,842	5,227,692	7,682,665	
MARSHALL	375,465,115	14,329,953	624,617,613	1,014,412,681	4,834,489	184,512	8,042,576	13,061,578	
MASON	2,139,097	5,630,226	26,604,391	34,373,714	31,214	82,156	388,211	501,581	
MCDOWELL	147,047,998	43,638,224	367,808,078	558,492,300	1,893,390	561,886	4,785,871	7,191,147	
MERCER	1,352,015	1,927,503	15,313,086	18,592,604	18,463	26,922	209,116	253,901	
MINERAL	1,714,673	7,685,080	1,933,094	11,332,847	24,568	110,112	27,697	162,377	
MINGO	107,551,320	31,028,586	555,589,894	694,169,800	1,468,721	423,726	7,587,196	9,479,583	
MONONGALIA	107,194,462	11,273,488	180,482,014	298,949,954	1,240,026	130,412	2,087,816	3,458,259	
MONROE	0	48,796	0	48,796	0	623	0	623	
MORGAN	0	13,553	0	13,553	0	183	0	183	
NICHOLAS	92,315,735	29,936,732	280,338,833	402,591,300	1,046,880	339,483	3,179,042	4,565,385	
OHIO	24,021,125	733,856	234,882,325	259,637,306	323,997	9,898	3,168,093	3,601,988	
PENDLETON	0	11,003	0	11,003	0	89	0	89	
PLEASANTS	0	87,562	478,155	565,717	0	1,292	7,072	8,365	
POCAHONTAS	0	7,488,568	288,448	7,777,016	0	60,792	2,342	63,134	
PRESTON	1,296,614	4,181,615	18,738,380	24,216,809	13,529	43,631	195,516	252,676	
PUTNAM	0	1,500,697	8,440,672	9,941,369	0	22,637	127,319	149,956	
RALEIGH	228,683,462	40,567,138	487,876,771	758,827,371	3,369,879	697,797	7,186,405	11,154,082	
RANDOLPH	1,270,932	30,668,462	26,983,097	58,923,391	13,162	317,603	279,448	610,211	
RITCHIE	0	88,658	218,066	306,724	0	1,186	2,916	4,102	
ROANE	0	143,390	0	143,390	0	1,416	0	1,416	
SUMMERS	0	594,033	389,860	983,893	0	4,840	3,177	8,017	
TAYLOR	9,439,176	24,443,173	204,833,997	238,716,346	121,765	315,317	2,842,359	3,079,441	
TUCKER	16,600,477	2,244,053	50,891,892	69,736,422	134,862	18,231	419,446	568,539	
TYLER	0	429,401	338,315	767,716	0	8,028	4,780	10,779	
UPSHER	41,894,667	21,804,634	90,928,886	154,628,167	440,145	229,079	955,299	1,624,524	
WAYNE	90,345,640	4,969,340	253,179,852	348,494,932	1,358,437	74,719	3,806,814	5,239,970	
WEBSTER	26,400,159	19,199,076	28,755,980	75,355,215	215,108	156,434	242,452	613,994	
WETZEL	39,601,899	7,225,791	36,839,358	83,767,043	580,308	100,410	513,309	1,164,027	
WIRT	0	149,392	0	149,392	0	2,160	0	2,160	
WOOD	0	4,082	200,601	204,683	0	51	2,663	2,717	
WYOMING	211,150,757	32,791,614	390,612,762	634,555,133	2,891,076	448,983	5,348,270	8,688,329	
STATE TOTALS	2,972,368,849	698,878,756	7,999,833,333	11,040,770,938	40,663,735	8,855,775	101,813,496	151,333,006	